

Spring 1971

## Comprehension: A Study of the Interpretation of Identical Reading Selections by Fifth Grade Students from Different Cultural Environments.

Adrienne Bailor Grant  
*Central Washington University*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.cwu.edu/etd>



Part of the [Educational Assessment, Evaluation, and Research Commons](#), and the [Elementary Education Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Grant, Adrienne Bailor, "Comprehension: A Study of the Interpretation of Identical Reading Selections by Fifth Grade Students from Different Cultural Environments." (1971). *All Master's Theses*. 1620.  
<https://digitalcommons.cwu.edu/etd/1620>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Master's Theses at ScholarWorks@CWU. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@CWU. For more information, please contact [scholarworks@cwu.edu](mailto:scholarworks@cwu.edu).

COMPREHENSION: A STUDY OF THE INTERPRETATION OF IDENTICAL  
READING SELECTIONS BY FIFTH GRADE STUDENTS  
FROM DIFFERENT CULTURAL ENVIRONMENTS

---

A Thesis  
Presented to  
the Graduate Faculty  
Central Washington State College

---

In Partial Fulfillment  
of the Requirements for the Degree  
Master of Education

---

by  
Adrienne Bailor Grant

May, 1971

APPROVED FOR THE GRADUATE FACULTY

---

Doris E. Jakubek, COMMITTEE CHAIRMAN

---

Daryl D. Basler

---

Ronald J. Boles

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful for the understanding and encouragement of my entire committee: Mrs. Doris E. Jakubek, chairman; Dr. Daryl D. Basler and Dr. Ronald J. Boles.

A special thank you is extended to Dr. Azella Taylor, from whom the idea came, and who gave most generously of her time and resource materials.

Laurels to Adam and Beth, my children, whose faith in me and unswerving loyalty made the completion of this thesis possible.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
I. THE PROBLEM AND DEFINITIONS OF TERMS USED . . . . .	1
Introduction . . . . .	1
The Problem . . . . .	2
Statement of the problem . . . . .	2
Hypothesis . . . . .	2
Importance of the study . . . . .	2
Procedures Used . . . . .	4
Limitations of the study . . . . .	5
Definitions of Terms Used . . . . .	6
Organization of Remainder of the Thesis . . . . .	7
II. REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE . . . . .	8
What is Comprehension? . . . . .	8
Teacher-Student Questioning . . . . .	13
The Culturally Disadvantaged Student . . . . .	16
III. PROCEDURES AND GROUPS STUDIED . . . . .	20
Introduction . . . . .	20
Population and Sample . . . . .	20
Procedure for the Study . . . . .	21
IV. ANALYSIS OF THE DATA . . . . .	23
Introduction . . . . .	23
Results of the Study . . . . .	25
V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS . . . . .	46
Conclusions . . . . .	46
Recommendations . . . . .	47

PAGE

REFERENCES . . . . . 49

APPENDICES

A. Reading Selections Read by Fifth Grade Children . 53  
B. Transcript of Student Responses from School A . . 63  
C. Transcript of Student Responses from School B . . 84  
D. Transcript of Student Responses from School C . . 102  
E. Transcript of Student Responses from School D . . 119

## LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	PAGE
I. Children's Responses Indicating Understanding of Concept That Jo Was A Girl . . . . .	37
II. Children's Responses Indicating Understanding of Concept That We Should Conserve Our Hawks . .	39
III. Children's Responses Inferring the Poem Was About Pollution . . . . .	41

## CHAPTER I

### THE PROBLEM AND DEFINITIONS OF TERMS USED

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Comprehension is multi-faceted in definition: Spache stated, "The term comprehension is one that is used glibly by many teachers and reading experts. Yet the meaning given the word differs greatly from one user to the next" (25:454).

Again Spache commented:

If we can judge from Traxler's study, even the test construction experts are confused as to the nature of comprehension and the ways of measuring its development. In a group of reading comprehension tests that Traxler surveyed, there was at least one skill measured in each test that no other of the twenty-five tests measured. Apparently almost every reading test constructor has unique ideas regarding the components of comprehension (25:426).

Spache cited a study by Socher who found:

. . . that comprehension may not be composed of fifty or more supposedly discrete skills, but may be a much more general process. All the separate skills identified by various authors or test makers may simply be labels given by them to the kinds of questions they ask, rather than distinct, trainable reading behaviors. If these facts are true, and there is little reason to doubt them we are offering a very disturbing concept for the teacher who has been led to believe that comprehension is developed by the sequential practice of a certain number of discrete skills which later automatically blend into the total act of comprehension (25:458).

In a study, "Questioning Strategies of Elementary teachers in Relation to Comprehension," Frank Guszak invited the reader to "join the researcher in the activity of posing



interesting hypotheses and questions about potential relationships between certain questioning strategies and subsequent student comprehension skills" (7:111).

## II. THE PROBLEM

### Statement of the Problem

Therefore, it was the purpose of this study to ascertain the reading comprehension of randomly selected fifth grade students who had all read identical reading selections of fiction, nonfiction, and poetry, and who were asked to respond orally to open-ended questions.

### Hypothesis

The investigator hypothesized that children from different cultural backgrounds would bring different interpretations to identical reading selections when these children were asked open-ended questions.

### Importance of the Study

Robinson, 1967-1968 President of the International Reading Association, stated:

Reading (as viewing and observing, listening, speaking, and writing) is a process, not a subject. It has no content of its own . . . Although a brief segment of the primary school curriculum focuses on reading as such in order to help learners make the transition from spoken to written language, the bulk of the school curriculum at all levels must emphasize the acquisition of the ability to read the multivariied materials confronting the learner in his society (21:1).

Horn commented:

The author does not really convey ideas to the reader; he merely stimulates him to construct them out of his own

experience. If the concept is already in the reader's mind, the task is relatively easy, but if, as is usually the case in school, it is new to the reader, its construction more nearly approaches problem-solving than simple association (12:10).

Chall said, "We read in order to gain experience, and yet we get more out of reading if we have more experience" (22:22).

Smith and Dechant stated, "Reading typically is the bringing of meaning to rather than the gaining of meaning from the printed page" (22:22). They cited Noble who pointed out:

. . . that a single word such as home can be a stimulus for a wide variety of meanings: family, spouse, children, friends, love, and many others. Thus the meaningfulness of a word depends upon the number of appropriate responses that have become associated with it (22:73).

Guszak found in one study that "teachers receive immediate right answers approximately 57 percent of the time, a fact which indicates that teachers generally design questions that take hold immediately. As might be anticipated, these questions are most frequently the simple recall variety" (7:113).

Guszak pointed out:

Everyone has experienced the situation wherein a question will be greeted by a noisy silence or by a totally incorrect response. Note how the teacher's actions might be characterized by one of the following:

1. The teacher answers the question herself.
2. The teacher clarifies the question and tries again (keeping the same question open).
3. The teacher offers additional cues in hope of getting the desired response.

Sometimes the teacher's additional cueing will reduce the answer possibilities to a good guess possibility (7:113-114).

Guszk posed a challenging question to teachers: "Do I really provide students with opportunities to do the thinking, or do I step in too quickly with my desired answer" (7:114)?

### Procedures Used

Since the investigator hypothesized that children from different cultural backgrounds would bring different interpretations to identical reading selections, only an open-ended question could test this hypothesis.

In this study the investigator attempted to learn if, without "setting the stage" by asking specific or cued questions about each selection, fifth grade children from varied cultural backgrounds would read for the literal, or interpretive, or critical meaning of a selection and verbally communicate this knowledge. In addition, an attempt was made to discover whether children would indicate a demand for meaning by summarizing or elaborating on the selections read and what effect a completely open-ended question would have on a child's response to a selection. To find the answers to these questions the following investigation was conducted.

Six students were randomly selected from each of four schools in two Central Washington counties whose populations represented, urban, rural, and differing socioeconomic environments. The only requirement was that each child be able to read the three randomly selected literary selections from

fifth grade basal readers. Open-ended questions were devised to elicit candid responses from each participating student. The selections were read and questions asked in a one day period to alleviate any student interaction during the questioning period. Each question period was tape-recorded to aid in the analysis of the data.

#### Limitations of the Study

1. The study was conducted with twenty-four children which is a relatively small sample. Perhaps more conclusive evidence for/against the hypothesis would have been obtained had the sample been larger.

2. The study required that all students participating be able to read the selections for this study.

3. The children's responses were dependent upon the reading selections presented to them. Since the reading selections were randomly chosen, children's backgrounds and interests could not be considered.

4. The children's responses may have been affected by the fact that this was a special project, and the investigator was unknown to the children.

5. The children were chosen by each classroom teacher rather than by a more objective, random method.

6. The term "culturally disadvantaged" was limited in scope and meaning for the purpose of this study.

### III. DEFINITION OF TERMS USED

#### Open-ended Questions

Paul Torrance's definition of this term was used: ". . . refers to any question that invites a great diversity of responses of divergent thinking" (22:189).

#### Cued Questions

Those questions which are asked to elicit a "correct" answer as determined by the teacher or the textbook.

#### Urban Population

All persons living in places of 2,500 inhabitants or more incorporated as cities, boroughs, villages, and towns.

#### Rural population

The population not classified as urban constitutes the rural population.

#### Culturally Disadvantaged

For the purpose of this study, the definition of culturally disadvantaged was limited to (a) children from different ethnic backgrounds; to (b) children from both low and high socioeconomic levels; and to (c) children from differing environments; namely, urban and rural. This definition was limited in order that comparisons could be made among these three examples.

#### IV. ORGANIZATION OF REMAINDER OF THE THESIS

The remainder of this thesis covers the following topics. Chapter II reviews the literature in three sections: a discussion of comprehension, teacher-student questioning, and the culturally disadvantaged student. Chapter III introduces the reading selections used in this study; and defines population, sample, and procedures. Chapter IV states the results of the study. Chapter V deals with conclusions and recommendations.

## CHAPTER II

### REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

The disparity among reading experts over the definition of comprehension is evidenced throughout the literature. This chapter deals with some of the complexities of the reading process; some basic philosophies on the importance of teacher-student questioning; and a brief discussion of the reading problems facing students who are culturally disadvantaged.

#### I. WHAT IS COMPREHENSION?

The goal of all reading is the comprehension of meaning (10:396), (3:400), and (23:255). However, Donald Cleland summarized the divergencies among reading scholars quite aptly:

The fact that the reading process is complex, that it is premised upon the modes of thinking, has not deterred scholars from trying to fathom its depths. How familiar are we with such models as have been structured by the following scholars? . . . even a cursory glance of the literature reveals that no one model is universally accepted.

1. The substrata-factor theory, as developed by Holmes and his co-workers. In this structure he has attempted to relate ideas of the function of the brain to the reading process.
2. The neuro-chemical model as designed by Smith and Carrigan. They postulate that a chemical imbalance, due to inappropriate amounts of acetylcholine and cholinesterase in the synapses is the primary cause of reading retardation.

3. Implications to the teaching of reading by Spache's application of Guilford's famous model of the structure of the intellect.
4. McCullough's "Schema of Thought Patterns" which has some factors in common with Guilford's three-dimensional model of the structure of the intellect.
5. The Barrett Taxonomy of Cognitive and Affective Dimensions of Reading Comprehension. Clymer, who reports this model, claims that Barrett identifies two misconceptions which teachers face in instruction in comprehension: a) considering comprehension as a single unitary skill and b) assuming that comprehension contains so many separate skills as to be unmanageable.
6. The Gray and Robinson model, essentially a skills model, which maintains that understandings, skills, and attitudes can be classified under four headings; namely, word perception, comprehension, reaction, and evaluation of ideas, and assimilation of what is read.
7. Cleland's offer of a comprehension model in which he has specified five processes which constitute the reading act: perception, apperception, abstraction, ideation, and application (1:98).

Despite the divergencies, there are areas of agreement which overlap, although they have often been given different names. J. P. Guilford stated:

During the past twenty years numerous investigations by the methods of factor analysis have brought to light some sixty different abilities having to do with intellectual activities. The large number is rather overwhelming to those who have been accustomed to the simple idea of one ability--intelligence--or at the most, the few primary mental abilities of Thurstone (6:176).

The first dimension of Guilford's model designated a group of cognitive abilities having to do with discovery or recognition of information which he termed ways of understanding or comprehension. A parallel group had to do with retention of information while two other groups were concerned with what was understood and how new information could be generated from that. He introduced the distinction



between divergent production (meaning to go beyond comprehension into productive thinking) and convergent production and culminated with evaluation, which he termed critical thinking.

The second dimension which cut across the first had to do with figural, or concrete information; symbolic, or abstract information as in letters, words, numbers; semantic, abstract information in the form of the things for which they stand--meanings or ideas; and behavioral information concerned with the thoughts, desires, feelings, and intentions of oneself and other individuals.

The third dimension was concerned with how an individual regarded his information--units, classes, relations, systems, transformations and implications.

Guilford commented that the prevailing model of behavior propounded by psychologists over the years was that of stimulus-response associations (6:179). The major types of thinking which emerged from his structure of the intellect were divergent production, convergent production, and evaluation. To him, the divergent production of transformation meant originality; the ability to evaluate meant form judgments.

Nila Banton Smith's (23:Ch.IX) comprehension hierarchy as compiled for this study indicates many similarities, the most apparent being the ability to form judgments, or evaluate, which is placed at the highest level, that of critical thinking (Ch.IV: pages 23-24).

Spache cites Donald L. Cleland's analysis of the thinking processes inherent in the comprehension act:

- Perception--a meaningful response to the graphic symbols we call words, sentences, paragraphs, etc.
- Apperception--relating new material to one's background of experience; matching the reader's experiences to those offered by the writer.
- Abstraction--selecting, choosing and rejecting perceptions, concepts, images
- Appraisal--estimating the validity of these poor processes
- Ideation--inductive reasoning or generalizing opinions, conclusions, or judgments
  - deductive reasoning or examining the facts in the light of a known principle or fact
  - critical reasoning--interaction between the reader and the writer involving evaluation by the reader
  - problem solving--(a) becoming aware of a problem; (b) orienting to the problem; (c) forming a tentative solution; (d) evaluating or testing the solution; (e) testing the final solution by use or application
  - creative thinking--the making of new syntheses or seeing new relationships.
- Application--the uses that a reader makes of the ideas acquired by reading (25:460).

If one regarded comprehension solely as skill development, he would be overwhelmed by the varying lists of skills. Spache gave one example by comparing a list of comprehension skills composed by Roy McCanne and a list of critical reading skills identified in ten basal reading programs by Gertrude Williams (25:455-457). Spache concluded:

There is not only considerable overlap between these so-called comprehension and critical reading skills, but even duplication within each list. Besides, both lists probably include items that almost any reader would demand must be defined more clearly (25:457).

Morris Finder (4:581-582) listed ten skills of comprehension for making inferences and identifying cause and effect. Edward D'Angelo listed four critical reading skills which could be applied to teaching critical reading through literature. He believed critical thinking should not be equated

with creative thinking, problem solving, imaginative thinking and other kinds of thinking. He stated:

Critical thinking is not a singular skill; it is a generic term used to denote many kinds of skills. Distinguishing a fact from an opinion, recognizing and evaluating assumptions, and discovering fallacious arguments are just a few of these skills (2:634-635).

Marion D. Jenkinson commented that critical reading has been so variously defined that it is difficult to relate the findings and conclusions of differing studies (14:546). She made the observation:

. . . The problems of developing cognitive capabilities which evolve as the child progresses through school are rarely considered. . . . It would seem that we should investigate closely the classifying, categorizing capabilities of the child which Piaget, Vygotsky, and Luria have shown as developing throughout the school years. The ways in which a child matures from concrete operations to the ability to manipulate abstractions has seldom been recognized by researchers in this field.

One of the major problems in assessing reading comprehension is to differentiate between the factors which are involved in language acquisition and those which are closely connected with the difficulties encountered in reading comprehension (14:547-548).

Reading comprehension is much more than a decoding process (25:458), or a wide-range vocabulary (16:5), or the ability to simply recall facts (3:400).

McKee (17:62), Spache (25:7), Heilman (11:436), and Dechant (3:41) contend that the reader brings his own experience to the printed page, and these experiences or lack of experiences limit the depth of the reader's comprehension.

Reading in the content areas presents a child with new concepts, advanced vocabulary, and requires him "to check his inferences against his experience and information" (19:125). A child must learn to vary his speed, spot important

facts and essential concepts and organize essential points into a meaningful structure. "Hopefully such organization leads to many meaningful associations, to broad generalizations, and to application. . . ." (15:158).

The foundation for all reading skills should be laid in the elementary grades and reviewed as the child proceeds through school.

Nila Banton Smith made specific observations for the future:

One of our most urgent objectives for the future is to teach students to think; hence, the emphasis on all of our teaching in reading should be on interpretation and creative reading. The extent to which a computer can develop these kinds of thinking processes is highly questionable . . . (24:470).

In the future, however, several new skills will be needed in working with the many different media in schools. Students will need to read indexes prepared by computers, telewriting of lectures given at distant places; microfilm newspapers; microtransparencies enlarged on the screen; data and statistical language processed by computers; charts and graphs on screens; microfiche in files of library books; and many signs, abbreviations, and codes necessary in plugging-in for specific information . . . (24:474-475).

## II. TEACHER-STUDENT QUESTIONING

Guszak noted that reported research found that teachers tended to emphasize recall thinking about reading and tended to miss opportunities to formulate groups of questions that would extend thinking (7:116).

Jenkinson (14:551) perceived that a teacher must teach for transfer of learning. Children even in primary grades can be guided by skillful questioning "to think about

the things they read, or see, or hear and to react critically . . ." (13:242).

Paul Torrance pointed out:

The term 'open-ended' question as it is used here, refers to any question that invites a great diversity of responses of divergent thinking. Open-ended questioning involves the pupil in thinking of possibles and going off into different directions to find the answer, instead of striving for one 'correct' or 'accepted' answer. The pupil responds in terms of his own experiences whatever these may be (28:189).

Hilda Taba stated:

Open-ended questions are often used as a device to tap the ideas, concepts, and feelings students may have on certain problems or in certain areas of experience. . . . The questions can be formulated around any pertinent point. The range of such questions is limited only by the teacher's ingenuity in inventing them, and her ability to discern the areas of pressing concern to students and to focus on points which are helpful in guiding her teaching . . . (27:25).

Questions that call for divergent thinking, as does the open-ended question, give all children a chance to share their ideas with others. This sort of question may bother a child who has been used to answering questions which called for a "correct" answer. Torrance cautioned against an abrupt change in questioning strategies by suggesting a transition period which allows the children to feel secure while they become accustomed to the freedom of the open-ended question (28:197).

Torrance and Taba both agreed that the classroom must be free from any sense of threat. The manner in which a teacher receives a child's response is vitally important. He must show acceptance of the response, but needn't be overly

effusive. Pupil responses are not rejected by the teacher for open-ended questioning elicits a variety of answers.

A teacher must help students develop a systematic sequence of questions. When ideas are developed in a discussion sequence there is a heightening of perception and insight becomes possible.

A significant result of open-ended questioning is that children learn that they have worthwhile ideas. Open-ended questions that feature original thinking can do a great deal for a child's self-concept.

Torrance pointed out:

. . . Children need guidance in learning the skills of asking questions that enable them to find out the truth about things. In recent years, research and development projects have yielded findings that are helpful in accomplishing this task. For example, Suchman (1962) has developed and tested materials for better inquiry skills. Maw and Maw (1966) have developed materials for understanding and encouraging curiosity among children. Torrance is currently experimenting with the use of pictures, stories, puppets, and other materials to develop higher-level questioning skills among pre-primary children (28:61).

Meredith Gall in "The Use of Questioning in Teaching" cited an interesting program:

Recently a program was developed at the Far West Laboratory for Educational Research and Development (Borg, Kelley, Langer & Gall, 1970) to help teachers achieve similar changes in their questioning behavior. Called a minicourse, it is a self-contained, inservice training package requiring about 15 hours to complete. The minicourse relies on techniques such as modeling, self-feedback, and microteaching (Allen & Ryan, 1969) to effect behavioral change. In a field test with 48 elementary-school teachers, the minicourse produced many highly significant changes in teachers' questioning behavior, as determined by comparisons of pre- and post-course videotapes of 20-minute classroom discussions: increase in frequency of redirection questions (questions designed to have a number of students

respond to one student's original question) from 26.7 to 40.9; increase in percentage of thought questions from 37.3% to 52.0%; and increase in frequency of probing questions (questions which require students to improve or elaborate on their original response) from 8.3 to 13.9. As in Houston's program (1938), there was also a reduction in frequency of poor questioning habits: repetition of one's questions (from 13.7 to 4.7 occurrences); repetition of students' answers (from 30.7 to 4.4 occurrences); and answering of one's own questions (from 4.6 to .7 occurrences). The Far West Laboratory now supports the development of about 20 additional mini-courses to deal with other types of classroom teaching such as tutoring, role-playing, lecturing, and the inquiry method. Many of these courses include training in questioning skills that are appropriate to the particular teaching-learning context (5:717).

### III. THE CULTURALLY DISADVANTAGED STUDENT

Most authorities concurred that children who are culturally disadvantaged are less proficient in language, leave school at an earlier age, have more adjustment problems, and are less interested in school. Their self-concept is usually low, and thus they frequently do not aspire to high levels of achievement.

Spache believed the reading process was based on sociological roots. Those social factors such as education, cultural interests, income level, and family stability affected the child's purposes and uses of the reading process (25:21).

Joseph Napoli found that although the number of books in the home did not always determine a good or poor reader, in his study the good readers generally had more books and reading matter at home and more emphasis was placed on education in the home (18:557).

Spache reported a study by Irving D. Harris:

He finds direct relationship between lower-class origin and low-average intelligence scores, repetition of grades, low familial values on education, and less intellectual stimulation. Other socioeconomic characteristics which he believes contribute to academic and reading failures are employment of the mother outside the home, large families, and father's occupation and education. Like a number of other writers in this field, Harris stresses the inherent conflict between the mores of the lower-class child and the middle-class values of the school and of teachers as a source of what appear to be learning problems (25:23-24).

Barton and Wilder's study, cited by Spache, considered:

. . . socioeconomic class to be the most important single factor in reading progress in school. Their national survey of elementary school teachers permitted the classification of classrooms according to parental income and occupation. The data of the study indicated that reading retardation below expected grade norms rises steadily through the first six grades for working-class children, and markedly so for the children of the lower-skilled, lower-paid working class. By the fourth grade about half of the classrooms of lower-class children show a degree of retardations as much as one year below grade level. The converse of this is also present in the Barton-Wilder study. Upper-class children tend to become advanced in reading from the first grade and to maintain this academic advantage. Some other observers of these trends would point out that they are reinforced by the differences among schools in upper-and lower-class communities in the training and skill of teachers, the supply of instructional materials, and, of course, teacher expectations (25:24).

Spache quoted Mingoia's description of an extreme underachiever in a large city school system:

The typical extreme underachiever is a boy who comes from a home experiencing cultural and economic deprivation. The home history indicates little language training which would have stimulated conceptual thinking, vocabulary development, and appreciation for stories and language. The pupil, often pseudo bilingual or Negro attends a primary grade in which his peers come from a similar social and cultural background. Neither has this culturally handicapped child had sufficient training with oral language and listening before initial reading



instructions. The extreme underachiever is usually unresponsive to group instruction, never reads at home, and resents learning through books.

Although his IQ registers from 82 to 95, this extreme underachiever, when a sixth grader, has a difficult time reading a second reader. His brothers and sisters tend to underachieve, and it is not unusual in these cases to find parents unemployed or involved in domestic strife (25:24-25).

A sense of personal involvement and the need to experience success are particularly important for children of a deprived cultural background. Educational programs must be geared to the existing developmental stages, at whatever level they may be. School must ". . . bridge the conflict between the culture of the home and that of the school" (27:16).

Research substantiated the lack of agreement among reading experts as to what constitutes comprehension. Spache observed that in studies cited all the skills and subskills tested "boil down to only three major processes--word meanings, relationships among ideas, and reasoning processes" (25:462). Word recognition, or decoding of the printed symbol, does not guarantee understanding. Among the many authorities in reading it was emphasized that experiences or lack of experiences limit the depth of the reader's comprehension. The aim must be for critical reading--the development of children's ability to think.

Only in the latter period of the past decade have reading experts begun to investigate and correlate teacher questioning strategies with the development of good comprehension. Taba believed that the open-ended question was one device to tap spontaneous responses rather than studied answers. It's

the spontaneous response which has proved successful in revealing the areas of pressing concern to children. Once freed to express themselves, children can then be encouraged to ask the kinds of questions which enable them to find out the truth about things.

Research has much to say about the effect of the socioeconomic level on children's responses to reading. Children from this background face the conflict between the mores of the lower-class child and the middle-class values of the school. Add to this problem a culturally handicapped child with insufficient training in oral language and listening before initial reading instruction and a teacher is faced with a child who is often un-cooperative and lacking in motivation.

## CHAPTER III

### PROCEDURES AND GROUPS STUDIED

#### I. INTRODUCTION

To test the hypothesis that children from different cultural backgrounds would bring different interpretations to identical reading selections when these children were asked un-cued, open-ended questions, the investigator chose three literary selections (Appendix A, pages 53-62) of fiction (20:54), nonfiction (26:60), and poetry (9:62) were chosen at random from fifth grade basal readers. The title of the poem, "Smoke Animals," was omitted as it was a context clue which could have influenced the reader's interpretation of the poem. Both titles of the other selections were retained.

#### II. POPULATION AND SAMPLE

The investigator conducted the study in two Central Washington counties with a total of twenty-four children from four schools whose populations represented urban, rural, and differing socioeconomic environments. Six fifth grade students in each of the four schools were selected at random from a class list obtained from each teacher. The only requirement was that the student be able to read the selections. If he could not, he was replaced by a student who could.

## III. PROCEDURE FOR THE STUDY

The investigator called each child from the room and presented him with one selection at a time. When the child had completed the silent reading of each selection he was asked three open-ended questions. The child was requested not to discuss the selections with his classmates. Student responses were tape-recorded to aid in the analysis of the data and insure accuracy in recording responses.

The following questions were posed:

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.
2. What impressed you most in the story?
3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.
2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?
3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?
2. What do you think the poem is saying?

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Each child was greeted with the following introduction:

Good morning, I'm Mrs. . . . . What is your name? I go to college in Ellensburg. Thank you for helping me with a project I'm doing there.

I'll give you three different selections to read. At the end of each selection I'll ask you to tell me about what you have read, and I'll use this tape recorder to help me remember what you have told me. Please don't discuss this project with your friends until I have finished here today.

Do you have any questions?

Here is your first selection.

The children's responses were transferred from tape to typewritten transcript which facilitated analysis of the data. Analysis of responses was based on the literal, interpretive, and critical levels of comprehension, as compiled from Nila Banton Smith's comprehension hierarchy (23:Ch.IX).

## CHAPTER IV

### ANALYSIS OF THE DATA

#### I. INTRODUCTION

To test the hypothesis that children from different cultural backgrounds would bring different interpretations to identical reading selections when these children were asked un-cued, open-ended questions, the investigator chose three literary selections of fiction, nonfiction, and poetry which were randomly selected from fifth grade basal readers. The criteria for analyzing the data was adapted from Nila Banton Smith's comprehension hierarchy as presented in her book, Reading Instruction for Today's Children (23:Ch.IX).

#### Comprehension Hierarchy

##### Critical

Judging quality, value, accuracy, truthfulness, style  
Comparing with works of similar nature  
Distinguishing between emotional and reasoned reactions

##### Interpretation

Generalizing  
Sensing author's intent and mood  
Forming sensory images  
Speculating on what happened between events  
Drawing inferences and conclusions

Anticipating outcomes

Determining cause and effect

Seeing relationships:

    between time and place  
    between setting and characters  
    among ideas  
    among events

### Literal

Arranging sequence of ideas or events

Finding supporting details

Stating main idea, main events

Understanding at the lowest level--literal comprehension--must be ensured before a child proceeds to higher levels.

To portray each student's oral responses (Appendices B,C,D,E, pages 63-133) as accurately as possible, many marks of punctuation were omitted. The criteria used by the investigator in transcribing the tapes were as follows:

1. If the student did not indicate by voice intonation that punctuation was intended, the response was indicated by a run-on sentence.

2. Whenever a student hesitated, three successive dots (...) indicated the hesitation.

3. A short pause was indicated by five successive dots (.....); a medium pause by ten successive dots (.....); and a lengthy pause--in excess of thirty seconds--by fifteen successive dots (.....).

4. If a student responded with one word and immediately changed the word, no punctuation was used. For example,

Child One from School A made this response ". . . they their other cousin was knew that they were gonna get into trouble . . ."

5. An incompleted word was indicated by two dots (...).

6. At times a student sighed and this was indicated by (sigh); a laugh by (laugh).

7. When a student accented a word it was indicated by a broken line.

8. Any investigator comments were included in brackets.

9. Every attempt was made to repeat student responses as accurately as possible. Colloquial speech, dialect, repetitions, and omissions were reproduced without editing.

The data of the study were treated: (1) by a brief description of the school, and of each child's responses; (2) by an analysis of commonalties and disparities; and (3) by a discussion regarding possibilities for certain student responses.

## II. RESULTS OF THE STUDY

### School A

Although classified as urban, this school was centered in a primarily agricultural area. The children of other ethnic backgrounds exceeded in number those children from Caucasian backgrounds (Appendix B, pages 63-83).



Child One

Interpretation for this Mexican girl was at the literal and interpretive level in the fiction selection. She stated many of the main ideas in sequence but omitted and made incorrect responses to several details in the story. An obvious example was her comment that, ". . . they turned the light off and on so that they could 'ttract someone's attention . . ." She made an inference in sensing the author's mood. In the nonfiction selection she misinterpreted the main idea in her response to question one, but in question two drew the inference and conclusion that our birds of prey are ". . . becoming extinct and they're killing them too much?" In the poem she gave a literal interpretation and inferred that smoke caused pollution.

Child Two

This Japanese boy made observations that transcended the literal level and moved to the interpretive level of the story in that he portrayed the mood and emotion of the characters and made comparisons such as, "Dan acted like uh like he was steering like he was steering it and they they were two outboard motors." In the nonfiction section he drew the interpretive conclusion that the article was about conservation. The poem indicated his imagination was stirred by his comment, ". . . The way I see it in my mind they look long like sorta like a lizard's body . . ."

Child Three

This Japanese girl was the only one of the twenty-four students to summarize the story, but she did so in such a way, with long pauses, that it was difficult to determine whether she knew the story on the literal level. She kept her eyes down and gave the appearance in speech and manner of being very shy. Her interpretation of the nonfiction selection was literal, although she made an interpretive conclusion that the main idea was conserving the wild hawks, and then inferred "all game birds." In the poem, she gave the literal meaning, and then inferred pollution, but ended on the critical level with a value judgment: "And that it's...hmm making things die." One teacher comment about this girl, "She's just one learning packet behind us." [Referring to the teachers]

Child Four

This girl is half Indian. She missed few details in the story on the literal level; in fact, her answers were very complete. She again displayed mastery of detail and moved to the interpretive level to draw the conclusion that hawks should be saved in the nonfiction selection. Her analysis of the poem was strictly literal but she made a critical evaluation saying, "Well, smoke can be pretty, but it doesn't smell very good."

Child Five

From this Filipino boy's accent and a question at the end of the formal questioning period, the investigator learned the boy is bilingual, and has lived in the United States only

three years. He summarized the story with supporting details. He knew Jo was a girl. He interpreted the nonfiction selection on the literal level. He moved to the interpretive level on the poem, expressing its contents as talking about pollution. He was the only one to query the investigator as to, "Is it big black animals like to crawl. What does she mean by that?"

### Child Six

This Caucasian boy gave a descriptive, literal interpretation of the story, and the nonfiction selection; however, he moved to the critical level and made the value judgment that, ". . . we're going to have to try and conserve everything . . . that . . . everything because pretty soon there isn't going to be room if we don't watch out." To jump from hawks to people as he did in question two would indicate his mind was ready to make comparisons--right or wrong. He interpreted the poem literally.

### School B

This was a rural school with children living on farms in the surrounding area. The children had read the story before, but the divergence in opinion and detail poses the question: Did each child comprehend what he read (Appendix C, pages 84-101)?

### Child One

Many details in the story were confused as in her comment that Jo did the kicking that put the boat on the

lighthouse shore. Her interpretation of the nonfiction selection was that hawks were bad, which is not the message conveyed. Interpreting the poem at the literal level, this girl used imagination and moved into the interpretive level of sensory images with her statement, "It's telling that you can see things that are just little things you can make big things out of...when you look at 'em."

#### Child Two

This boy put the details in sequence but many of his responses were not supported by the story. He called birds of prey "prairie birds" in the nonfiction selection, but understood the main idea. Description of the literal meaning of the poem was accurate but his inference was that we don't need pollution.

#### Child Three

A good sequence of events in the story was described by this girl, but in a run-on fashion. Her bird of prey in the nonfiction selection was a "bird of prayer." She concluded they should not shoot the bird of prayer. The poem was interpreted literally and then she mentioned a bird walking in the air, "And really it was only uh smoke and the bird was actually flying in the air instead of walking in a cloud." Whether she thought there was a real bird, or only an imaginative one is open to speculation, for she stated that the poem said, "Well, that sometimes you can just let your imagination go away... from you?"

Child Four

Details and main ideas were omitted from this boy's description of the story. He drew the conclusion that he wouldn't have gone out to the cabin cruiser. He gave a literal interpretation of the nonfiction selection and of the poem. However, he drew an inference about the way smoke looks when it comes out of chimneys, ". . . it looks like animals and stuff."

Child Five

Details of the story were in sequence and well expressed by this girl. In the nonfiction selection she recognized the main idea, but missed many details. Her interpretation of the poem transcended from the literal to the interpretive level; she responded to the sensory images of the smoke, and generalized that it "looks just like anything you can imagine."

Child Six

The boy was Polynesian, but had been adopted while very young by a Caucasian family. His report of the story was brief but accurate with one exception, ". . . they found out how to turn on the light, . . ." He summarized on the interpretive level of cause and effect in the nonfiction selection by saying that we need our birds of prey. His literal interpretation of the poem became interpretive and reached toward the critical level when he judged, ". . . smoke can make things look funny. . . ."

School C

A low socioeconomic level area surrounds this school. Many families are very large; there are children from broken homes; and family income is often erratic. The teacher of this class generalized that most of the children had emotional problems (Appendix D, pages 102-118).

Child One

This black girl interpreted the story accurately and thoroughly, but in a run-on fashion on the literal level until the ending where she missed the detail explaining how the children were rescued. Details and main ideas were not expressed as accurately in the nonfiction selection although she grasped the main idea. Her interpretation of the poem was on the literal level.

Child Two

This Mexican-American girl interpreted the story at the literal level and omitted the entire ending of the story. She referred to the lighthouse as a cabin. One might speculate about why the details of the beginning of the story were in sequence, accurate, and complete; but nothing was said about the conclusion. One can speculate as to whether she read the whole story. Her nonfiction selection also lacked completeness of detail. She interpreted the poem on the literal level, and then drew the inference that it was about pollution.

Child Three

Although this boy got off to a slow start, as evidenced by the number and length of pauses, he appeared to gain confidence because his description of the story's details were accurate and complete. He missed some of the details in his nonfiction narrative but summarized the main idea accurately. His response to the poem was incoherent. While on the literal level (he knew that it was talking about smoke) he concluded with, "I don't actually know what it means, but I know what it's talking about, though, smoke--and all that."

Child Four

Some main ideas were omitted from the story by this girl, but salient points were summarized. In the nonfiction selection many details were omitted but her conclusion that hawks shouldn't be killed indicated comprehension on the interpretive level. She summarized the poem well on the literal level.

Child Five

This girl showed lack of ability to relate main events in sequence in the story and nonfiction selections. One could speculate as to her attention span, or interest in reading. The poem was interpreted briefly, but accurately on the literal level.

Child Six

Imaginative ideas, but misinformation of details appeared in this boy's narration of the story, ". . . they went over

to the girl an an captured her an an tied her...up and then the the boys they they took the they untied her and took and threw the ladder into the boat. . . ." He said that he liked the ending ". . . where they found the island . . ." and, of course, the ending was the children's rescue from the lighthouse. He understood the main idea of the nonfiction selection. From the poem he inferred ". . . it (smoke) just clouds up the air so we can't breathe." And further inferred that we should get rid of air pollution.

#### School D

This school was located in an area of economic affluence. The responses of the children reflected their ability to think in complete sentences. The teacher of this class reported that they had spent several weeks discussing the drawing of inferences from varied reading materials (Appendix E, pages 119-133).

#### Child One

This girl indicated only two main ideas in her brief summary of the story. She introduced eagles into the selection on hawks and it was difficult to tell if she had a literal comprehension from her brief statement; however, her answer to question two indicated a grasp of the main idea. Her comments on the poem were on the literal level, but she indicated critical reading skill by comparing the poem to something she'd actually seen, "There's a chimney over by Everett that I've seen and it looks just like this describes." She drew the



inference that smoke looks ferocious, but that the big black clouds ". . . melt away sometimes. . . ."

#### Child Two

Brevity of response made it difficult to ascertain if this boy's literal comprehension included many of the omitted details of the story. His interpretation of the nonfiction selection was on the literal level. He made the judgment, "They gotta enforce their laws more." The imagery of the poem was understood and pollution inferred.

#### Child Three

Although this girl's summary of the story was brief, details were accurate and she interpreted the author's mood, ". . . and they were exhausted and cold and tired." She grasped the main idea that conservation of hawks is important, but her lack of details makes one speculate as to her literal comprehension. In the poem the factory smoke was interpreted as pollution; however, she generalized on the interpretive level, ". . . how industries think that all this--their waste and stuff--really doesn't do anything, but it really does."

#### Child Four

Details were summarized in sequence by this boy and important events in the story were summarized. A value judgment was made in question two of the nonfiction selection, ". . . if they keep up the way of killing animals for just the sport or for clothing or things that they're gonna uh kill the they're gonna kill all the wild life and that we need to keep

the uh food cycle going." In question three he compared the hawk and the bald eagle, ". . . the farmer's think that they are hawks and they shoot 'em but they're really the bald eagle babies and that's why the bald eagles are going extinct." His interpretation of the poem was on the literal level, but indicated a great deal of imagination (Appendix E, page 128), and inferred pollution.

#### Child Five

A very brief summary of the story's events was made by this girl; her summary was accurate. The main idea was obtained from the nonfiction selection. The interpretation of the poem indicated the inference of smoke making air pollution. She made a value judgment by concluding, "It should be more steam or something that doesn't pollute the air as much."

#### Child Six

This boy's literal comprehension of the story was brief, and to the point, although he omitted the detail of the children's rescue. The idea of conserving the hawk was evidenced in the nonfiction selection. He contradicts himself in the poem, which might indicate he was confused. To question one he replied, "Well, they're not really saying that it's polluting the air . . ." and proceeded with a literal interpretation. In question two he replied, "That smoke is polluting the air."

In analyzing the student responses, the investigator noted commonalities and disparities. A discussion of those most apparent follows.

A key point in the interpretation of the fiction selection was the fact that "Jo" was a girl. Even though the author of the story had placed in italics beneath the title a warning to the reader that he might be surprised about who was telling the story (Appendix A, page 54), this context clue was apparently not meaningful to the children (Table I). Only seven children correctly identified "Jo" as a girl. At the end of the story in the book there is a picture of the three children and Jo, between the scowling Dan and the smiling Ray, is a smiling girl. The picture clue, in this instance, would possibly have alleviated any confusion as to Jo's sex.

Another observation is that ten children missed the significance of what led to the children's rescue: "Soon the light keeper came to see why the beam seemed to go out every time it turned toward the American shore. He laughed when he saw that the window facing the shore had been painted black with the paint I'd [Jo] found in the storeroom" (Appendix A, page 59). One child stated ". . . they turned the light off and on so that they could 'ttract someone's attention . . ." (Appendix B, page 65). Another version was: ". . . they found a lamp and this guy knew how to work it. . . . . and . . . . . and then he threw somethin' and broke it and then . . . then . . . so that somebody--that's the only way he could get help-- . . ." (Appendix D, page 114). Another child remarked:

TABLE I  
CHILDREN'S RESPONSES INDICATING UNDERSTANDING  
OF CONCEPT THAT JO WAS A GIRL

Responses: School A							Responses: School B						
	1	2	3	4	5	6		1	2	3	4	5	6
Yes				x	x		Yes	x					x
No	x					x	No		x	x	x		x
Uncertain		x	x				Uncertain						
Responses: School C							Responses: School D						
	1	2	3	4	5	6		1	2	3	4	5	6
Yes	x					x	Yes	x					
No			x	x	x		No		x	x	x	x	x
Uncertain		x					Uncertain						

". . . but one night the light flashed on by itself so they know it was hopeless, but then finally after awhile the keeper came and they found 'em . . ." (Appendix E, page 122). In addition to the ten children who didn't state how the rescue took place, two children thought the paint was put on the light in the lighthouse, and one child made no mention of where the paint was placed.

One point of interest that causes the investigator to speculate about the meaning the children brought to the story is that only two children, both from School C, low socio-economic level, made reference to: "How good the sand tasted." (Appendix A, page 57). Do these children have background experience, perhaps happy memories, of sand? Or, conversely, have they ever "tasted" sand and found it unpleasant to the taste? Could they possibly have attached a feeling of security to the fact that the children were safe--at least--from the open sea?

Since the title of the nonfiction selection was "Saving Our Birds" (Appendix A, page 60), one could surmise that a number of students included the saving of all birds as important, although the main idea was conservation of the hawk (Table II).

One might speculate, however, on the observation that School B, rural, made the only two errors in describing the hawk: (1) as a "prairie bird, and (2) as a "bird of prayer." Being a rural community, one might generalize that familiarity

TABLE II

CHILDREN'S RESPONSES INDICATING UNDERSTANDING OF  
CONCEPT THAT WE SHOULD CONSERVE OUR HAWKS

Responses: School A							Responses: School B						
	1	2	3	4	5	6		1	2	3	4	5	6
Yes		x		x			Yes		x		x	x	x
No							No	x					
Uncertain	x		x		x	x	Uncertain			x			
Responses: School C							Responses: School D						
	1	2	3	4	5	6		1	2	3	4	5	6
Yes	x	x	x	x		x	Yes	x	x		x	x	x
No							No						
Uncertain					x		Uncertain			x			

with birds would have eliminated these errors. Perhaps there was simply a lack of background experience.

One interesting observation was that not one child missed the 85% of food eaten by the hawks, even though what they ate was frequently quoted erroneously. One might speculate upon the ease of remembering the only numerical symbol.

The poem was interpreted by the investigator as a good example of figurative expression as illustrated by the last two lines of the poem. Only four children interpreted the terrible fierceness of the smoke animals as just a joke:

. . . is just a joke  
For they're only made of a puff of smoke (Appendix A,  
page 62).

Twenty of the children inferred that the poem was about pollution. It would seem conceivable that since one of the current issues is pollution, that the children's awareness of this problem might have contributed to this interpretation (Table III).

Since the poem used metaphorical imagery and required the child to "read between the lines" for meaning, it was interesting to note twelve students responded at the literal level of comprehension; ten students used their imagination to form sensory images; and thirteen students made inferences. Since many students combined the above as in the example (Appendix B, page 67), the total number of responses exceeds the number of children in the study.

One can speculate as to why the child referred to in Appendix B, above, thought the smoke animals "ugly" and

TABLE III  
CHILDREN'S RESPONSES INFERRING THE  
POEM WAS ABOUT POLLUTION

Responses: School A							Responses: School B						
	1	2	3	4	5	6		1	2	3	4	5	6
Yes	x	x	x		x		Yes		x				
No				x			No	x		x	x	x	x
Uncertain						x	Uncertain						
Responses: School C							Responses: School D						
	1	2	3	4	5	6		1	2	3	4	5	6
Yes						x	Yes		x	x		x	x
No	x		x	x	x		No	x			x		
Uncertain		x					Uncertain						



". . . terrible things that harm the sky. . . ." Child Four (Appendix E, page 128) responded most interestingly on the literal, sensory, and inferential levels.

Well, that it's about smoke stacks and that this is this smoke comes out it makes forms that with your imagination you can think they're animals or things that you've seen before and people and then you can just keep watching 'em and you can think that they're doing things, but they're really not. . . . but they're also harmful . . . Or uh like they're smog and there's there smoke and pollute also, so some people think that they're terrible, but they also like it for their smoke because they make things that they like, also.

One outstanding fact was that the quantity of words used to tell about the selections read did not improve the quality of description. It was obvious that the students in School D organized their thinking into sentences much more frequently than did those students in the other three schools. One can speculate that they came from homes where better language skills were employed. But brevity of description, such as that given by Child Three (Appendix E, page 124), left the investigator speculating as to what details the child actually noted as he read.

A crisis in the fiction selection occurred when the boat was drifting with the current and the children might possibly have ended up in the Atlantic Ocean. Seven children mentioned that the children in the story had no oars and had to paddle with their hands; five children stated or implied that the children in the story rowed with oars; and twelve children made reference to the children in the story being in a boat without stating whether oars or hands were used to

paddle. One might speculate if the word "paddle" was confusing? Or, indeed, whether many of the children had had boating experience.

Jo, who narrates the story, didn't realize until the end of the story that Dan and Ray had been trying to get into a foreign country (Appendix A, page 59). Fourteen of the children who read the story noted this point.

Indicative of the interpretive level of reading is the ability to see relationships. Only four children commented that the story actually took place in Canada, even though, as indicated above, fourteen children realized the story was concerned with crossing the river to get into a foreign country. [The United States.] Could this have indicated a lack of geographical knowledge?

Five children mentioned a search of the lighthouse for food, but three different children mentioned that by the time they were rescued there would be only three skeletons. Food and becoming skeletons were seemingly not related.

Nila Banton Smith stresses that understanding at the lowest or literal level must be ensured before a child proceeds to higher levels. She states:

One of the most productive ways of developing ability to derive deeper meanings in reading is through discussion in which the teacher makes a special contribution by throwing in questions here and there to stimulate cause-and-effect reasoning and to point up the necessity for supplying details 'between the lines,' making comparisons, drawing inferences, and gathering generalizations (23: 268).

The data gathered for this study has indicated, however, that a child might not be able to fully explain the details of a reading selection, and yet be able to draw inferences, form sensory images, and sense the author's mood. Child Six from School A (Appendix B, page 83) indicated in his reply to the second question in the nonfiction selection that he was ready to move into value judgments.

The children whose home environment is culturally deficient in language skills, particularly the ethnic child who often comes from a bilingual home as did the Filipino boy (Appendix B, page 77); lacks appealing reading materials at the child's level of understanding; and lacks experiences as indicated by the fact that in School B, rural, the children had perhaps never seen factory chimneys belching forth smoke and therefore did not interpret the poem as having to do with pollution (Table III) are indications that cultural environments do indeed affect the way in which a child interprets a reading selection.

In the references cited, one point seemed clearly proved: no open-ended question can be left as such. All open-ended questions are simply a strategy which enables a teacher to unlock children's spontaneous responses. From there, through discussion, meaning can be clarified and children's insight deepened.

It was hypothesized that children from different cultural backgrounds would bring different interpretations to identical reading selections when these children were asked open-ended questions. The investigator believes that the

hypothesis was supported in the following ways: (a) comparison of the children's language skills between School A and School B, (b) the limited experiences of the children in School B as indicated by their responses to the poetry selection (Table III), (c) lack of the children's literal comprehension and ability to express themselves verbally as noted between School C and School D, and (d) the display of more fluent speech as indicated by fewer repetitions, pauses, and grammatical errors evidenced in children's responses in School D.

## CHAPTER V

### CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This study has not only aroused many questions upon which to speculate, but has also indicated conclusions and recommendations for future studies of this nature.

#### I. CONCLUSIONS

Children do not have to be from a different culture to interpret what they read in various ways. Indeed, the term interpretation is as multi-faceted as the term comprehension. The background experience of the child is of vital importance to the meaning he brings to his reading.

Conditioning can affect a child's thinking as was illustrated by the number of children who inferred the poem was about pollution. It is not wise for any teacher to surmise that all children are able to interpret a reading selection without planning questioning strategies which call for a deeper insight into the meaning of a reading selection. The open-ended question is one way of getting spontaneous responses, although it must be followed by a discussion period in which children see how many ways there are to interpret a reading selection. Children can learn from one another.

A simple recall of facts does not indicate a child comprehends what he has read; nor can one assume that a child's

thinking can at any time be confined to the literal level, for often he is ready to make the leap to judging and evaluating. Questioning strategies greatly influence the child in developing critical thinking.

The investigator, at the completion of the study, was not convinced that all children selected could read the material presented to them.

## II. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. A replication of this study with a larger sample would perhaps add more information in support for/against the hypothesis of this thesis.

2. If this study were conducted in a classroom where students were sharing their responses and discussion followed there would undoubtedly be more insight into the value of differing questioning strategies in developing a comprehension hierarchy as defined in this study.

3. Since this study was limited to two Central Washington counties, it would conceivably be altered if conducted in other geographic areas, and in schools with larger enrollments.

4. In a large city with slum areas, socioeconomic levels and cultural backgrounds would understandably play a more major role than they have in this study.

5. Additional studies might reveal significant differences if done at different grade levels.

6. The investigator recommends the use of the open-ended question to elicit candid student responses. One way of determining more of a child's grasp of the material would be to have all of the sample children from each school gather together at the end of the separate questioning period and proceed with a discussion of selections read. This would give more accurate information than was possible in the present study regarding a child's grasp of the meaning of selections read. It is possible that a discussion period would offer more positive information and eliminate as much speculation as this study required.

## REFERENCES



## REFERENCES

1. Cleland, Donald L. Pro-Challenger: "Do We Apply What We Know About Comprehension?" pp. 97-101 in Current Issues in Reading, Vol. 13, Part 2, Convention Proceedings, Smith, Nila B. (ed.). Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1969.
2. D'Angelo, Edward. "The Teaching of Critical Thinking Through Literature," Elementary English, XLVII (May 1970) pp. 633-637.
3. Dechant, Emerald V. Improving the Teaching of Reading. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1970.
4. Finder, Morris. "Teaching to Comprehend," Journal of Reading, Vol. 13 (May 1970) pp. 581-586, 633-636.
5. Gall, Meridith D. "The Use of Questions in Teaching," Review of Educational Research, Vol. 40 (December 1970) pp. 707-719.
6. Guilford, J. P. "Frontiers in Thinking That Teachers Should Know About," Reading Teacher, Vol. 13 (February 1960) pp. 176-182.
7. Guszak, Frank J. "Questioning Strategies of Elementary Teachers in Relation to Comprehension," pp. 110-116 in Reading and Realism, Vol. 13, Part 1, Convention Proceedings, Figurel, J. Allen (ed.). Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1969.
8. Guszak, Frank J. "Teacher Questioning and Reading," Reading Teacher, Vol. 21 (December 1967) pp. 227-234.
9. Harris, Albert J., Gartler, Marion, Roman, Caryl, Benditt, Marcella. "Smoke Animals," p. 302 in Bold Journeys, The Macmillan Reading Program. Fifth Reader. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1966.
10. Harris, Albert J. How to Increase Reading Ability. New York: Longmans, Green and Company, 1961.
11. Heilman, Arthur W. Principles and Practices of Teaching Reading. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Publishing Company, 1967.
12. Horn, Ernest. Methods of Instruction in the Social Studies. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1937.

13. Janes, Edith C. "Developing Critical Reading Skills in Literature," pp. 238-242 in Reading and Realism, Vol. 13, Part 1, Convention Proceedings, Figurel, J. Allen (ed.). Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1969.
14. Jenkinson, Marion D. "Cognitive Processes in Reading: Implications for Further Research and Classroom Practice," pp. 545-553 in Reading and Realism, Vol. 13, Part 1, Convention Proceedings, Figurel, J. Allen (ed.). Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1969.
15. Kingston, Albert J. "What Do We Mean by Reading in the Content Areas?" Journal of Developmental Reading, VII (Spring 1964) pp. 146-147, 158.
16. Lefevre, Carl A. Linguistics and the Teaching of Reading. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1964.
17. McKee, Paul. The Teaching of Reading in the Elementary School. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1948.
18. Napoli, Joseph. "Environmental Factors and Reading Ability," Reading Teacher, Vol. 21 (March 1968) pp. 552-557.
19. Parsley, Jerry H. "An Approach to Teaching Inferences-High School," pp. 123-126 in Reading and Realism, Vol. 13, Part 1, Convention Proceedings, Figurel, J. Allen (ed.). Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1969.
20. Robinson, Helen M., Monroe, Marion, Artley, A. Sterl, Huck, Charlotte S., Jenkins, William A., Aaron, Ira E., "Rivers Are to Cross," pp. 220-227 in Open Highways, The Open Highways Readers. Book 5. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Company, 1966.
21. Robinson, H. Alan. "Reading in the Total School Curriculum," pp. 1-7 in Reading and Realism, Vol. 13, Part 1, Convention Proceedings, Figurel, J. Allen (ed.). Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1969.
22. Smith, Henry P., and Dechant, Emerald V. Psychology in Teaching Reading. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1961.
23. Smith, Nila Banton. Reading Instruction for Today's Children. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1963.

24. Smith, Nila Banton. "The Future of Our Current Issues in Reading," pp. 464-487 in Current Issues in Reading, Vol. 13, Part 2, Convention Proceedings, Smith, Nila B. (ed.). Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1969.
25. Spache, George D., and Spache, Evelyn B. Reading in the Elementary School. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1969.
26. Stauffer, Russell G., Burrows, Alvina Treut, Horn, Thomas D., Irwin, Evelyn S. "Saving Our Birds," p. 62 in Through the Years, Winston Basic Readers. Book Five. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1962.
27. Taba, Hilda, and Elkins, Deborah. Teaching Strategies for the Culturally Disadvantaged. Chicago: Rand McNally & Company, 1968.
28. Torrance, E. Paul, and Myers, R. E. Creative Learning and Teaching. New York: Dodd, Mead and Company, 1970.

APPENDIX A

READING SELECTIONS READ  
BY FIFTH GRADE CHILDREN

RIVERS ARE TO CROSS BY  
L. R. DERBYSHIRE

Please note: This short story has been redacted due to copyright concerns.

"Rivers Are to Cross," pp. 220-227 in *Open Highways, The Open Highways Readers. Book 5*, Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Company, 1966.













## SAVING OUR BIRDS

Please note: This short story was redacted due to copyright concerns.  
"Saving Our Birds," p. 62 in Through the Years, Winston Basic Readers.  
Book Five. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1962.



--Rowena Bennett

Please note: This poem was redacted due to copyright concerns.  
"Smoke Animals" by Rowena Bennett, taken from  
p. 302 in Bold Journeys, The Macmillan Reading Program.  
Fifth Reader. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1966.

APPENDIX B  
TRANSCRIPT OF STUDENT RESPONSES  
FROM SCHOOL A

## CHILD ONE

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, they uh--when they were in the newspaper or just tell the story first? [Investigator repeated question one.]

Uh, they they made a headline in the paper uh it was named Youngsters Cheat Death and there was a picture of them and they said they were brave and it all started when uh .....when mother told Ray to a to take Dan...their cousin Dan for a walk and show him the city, so they started out uh uh Dan said that he didn't want to see the houses and stores so they were they were just closer together than they were in the country, but the river was different, and they wanted uh to go to a forjun country so they got into the river and the boat and and onto the river and they started-- it was foggy, it was getting foggy, and they started and they tried...they their other cousin was knew that they were gonna get into trouble 'cause they kept goin' in and out of the boat and they started out and they seized a man that was leaning over the uh rail was watching them, and Dan whispered to Ray that someone was looking at 'em. He didn't hear him and he said it a little bit louder and then he heard...the man just slipped off and went somewhere and they didn't see him again so they went an the fog was lifting uh...uh...heavier and they couldn't hardly see any more so they just paddled and thought they were lost or somethin' and they left and

pretty soon they were too tired to go any more so they put their paddles in and and just left it and pretty soon they knew they saw that the current was taking them and they couldn't stop it so they just let it go and they were in the fog and a storm was beginning to come and and Dan goes, "Look, there's an island," and they all started pushing with their feet and and trying ta.....beat the storm while they were going on. Pretty soon Dan's leg come tired and then he couldn't he couldn't pad.. kick anymore so uh Dan said that he must and so he did and they almost they got there just in time and they went into a lighthouse and they went upstairs they went up the stairs and sa.. found a lamp and they stood there waiting for the light keeper to come back but he didn't and the storm grew grew worse and they were, but they were safe in that lighthouse and pretty soon they knew that the light keeper would come 'cause the storm was slowing down so they turned the light off and on so that they could 'ttract someone's attention and pretty soon...they thought that the light keeper was gonna come but if he did they would find three skeletons in the in the lighthouse so they kept doing signaling and pretty soon the light keeper came and told them what had happened and they told him the story and they told him that they wanted to a go to a forjun country and but they couldn't make it so uh they jus' the light keeper took them back home and that's all--they got in the newspaper.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

Scared.



3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Well, just one thing, that they were really scared when they were in the fog, but they thought one would come and get 'em but they were jus' afraid of it--jus' afraid.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Okay, they say that a hawk is a a bad hawk and that 85% of the food eaten by the birds are is mice, rats and harmful like and uh...and they are and they're jus' getting, they're jus' vanishing from every part of the world, of the country, and they look as though...because they wanta eat them and sometimes by the end of the day there's two ta three feet of birds laying in a pile on the ground and they they become extinct, and and besides the hawks die right away if they're not cared for--if they're shot if they're shot in the wings and so that's uh why 85% of the food is mice, rats, and other rodents and uh sometimes they uh...some parts of the world they're becomin' extinct uh they set laws not to uh shoot 'em anymore--so that's like scientists say.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

That uh.....that they're becoming extinct and they're killing them too much?

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

That uh...smoke comes from the factory and they they push each other and they're shaped somethin' like animals and they form clouds that uh make it look ugly in the sky and that a and that their tails curve and that uh and the terrible terrible things that harm the sky and that they cause pollution and, but they're only puffs of smoke.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

The...smoke causes pollution and jus' how they're shaped and what they form um to?

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

CHILD TWO

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, there's these boys uh I think it was in Canada or America--well, they were lived near this big uh uh river and his mother told a a boy named Ray to a take out a Dan to show the city. Uh Dan didn't really wanta see the houses or stores so they took him to the river and there's one boy,

named Josephine, but Jo for short, and that well he didn't want to really--he didn't want to get in trouble so uh they were they go and they were they were running, they were rowing to the shore and they were jumping in and out of boats and finally they came to this little bay in the river...and they saw this big cruiser and they and and a Dan a wanted to pretend he was Indian and go to the cruiser and a Josephine was sorta kinda scared and against it but he went along anyway. They they got in they got in trembling and they went they went to the boat. Josephine was in charge of keeping keeping the boat near the cruiser. As they were get on the ladder which led to the top of the deck...a a man was watching them and Josephine whispered that somebody was watching them. Dan jumped down and a--I don't know what his name is--oh, well, the other boy he he a climbed down the ladder and they started paddling away like mad. By this time there was fog, there was fog down and they couldn't hardly see...they got out of their reach and they they sorta kinda hear this squeaky noise. They thought this man must be coming...they they heard it coming closer and closer. But then they all of a sudden they heard it stop and they thought that he a that he a that he gave up so so they it was really thick and dark was and night was coming and so Josephine got really scared now got real scared and what should we do and Dan boasted that he know knew which way to go so he started to paddle, paddeling, and then and Josephine said that they must have been drifting with the current so so uh uh uh Dan put his hand into the

water and and and sure enough they were, he says they were drifting with the current and he said, "Oh, so what?" and said by now they might have been in the Atlantic Ocean so that made Josephine worry more and then so when in the next morning the fog started lift up but then things came worse because there was a storm, so they--there was a storm coming up--and the current wasn't real strong. They saw an island with a lighthouse on it. They paddled and paddled, uh, the boy that uh, Rick or Rick he he he got off the end and started kicking and Dan he acted like uh like steering like he was steering it and they they were like two outboard motors. They got to the uh they got to the shore of the island and they went to the building, the lighthouse, and while they they they pulled themselves up the the stairs all the way up to the top and they wondered who would who would they were they were safe and they saw steamboats going past. They were going...they wondered how they would have stopped them even though they flashed 'em why they wouldn't stop, they'd probably think it was the light keeper or somethin'. So they had to wait. And then Josephine got up courage and he dared herself--uh, well, however--thought it was a boy-- (laugh) well dared her dared a dared her themselves to go look and they they found they found cans and cans and stuff and and paint and then well, they didn't know what to do and then why don't we just turn on turn off--turn on and turn off the light and Josephine said, "No! That might not be that might not be that might not be right because you might wreck

a boat or something." So what she did was paint one side of the window toward America and the light turned around and it didn't flash America and uh and uh the lighthouse keeper came to see what was the matter and he laughed when he a when he a saw what happened. At the last there was this tellin' about a picture that showed Rick smiling and Dan scowling and Josephine doing--I don't know what she was doing.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

I don't know...when, well, when they were getting scared and a storm was coming up and they were kinda getting real exciting when they were coming to the island and the storm was right behind them and lightening was flashing and all that.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, it's about a it's about a game, no, not game birds, but a birds that--prey birds. Uh, and well, a they they're trying to save the hawk and hunters say that hawks is a bad a bird and a and they shoot the bird either they shoot the bird either it would die it would get wounded and die of thirst and hunger and there's one hunter uh uh uh the days in Pennsylvania where hawks were killed by thousands--game birds--well, he told that a that a a a three feet...three feet of

these birds in piles were piled up two or three feet and the ones who were wounded would die of thirst and hunger and a these scientists have been telling for over twenty years or so that hawks the hawks and games birg games birg help man. It's true that they kill birds, chickens, but 98...85% of their of what they eat is insects, rats, mice, rodents, all the stuff that harms farmers, man, and what people don't like. But people keep on killing. They just don't listen so...conser-  
vation.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Well, the most important idea is conservation--keeping the wild hawks and all the game birds. If you don't have birds, what are you going to eat?

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Well, I think it's about pollution and uh uh they talk about how smoke is coming out like like a great...they crawl like a cloud and they they go they they're they're a huge black figure body and they have great big heads; their heads are held high an--the way I see it in my mind they look like long like sorta like a lizard's body and their heads up like this only they got a tail and they don't have any things, they

only have two legs, and they they come out of a chimney and they walk, they crawl...eh...That's all I can remember.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

Well, I'm not really sure about that, but I think it's saying that a a more more there's more pollution than anything; well, there's more well there's smoke is coming out of factories more than anything else.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### CHILD THREE

#### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Hmm, it's about these, it's about these people who are going to....well who....who went for a walk and and then ...well, they went into this boat and uhm they they were caught in a storm and then there's this one of the boys thought that a...that they...that they might land in the they might land in the Atlantic Ocean by the time the storm ended. But when this after after awhile the storm stopped and they went through lots of troubles so they got there...when they got their story on the front page of the newspaper.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

.....I don't know uh.....when the storm when the storm started coming up and they thought they

were going to land in the Atlantic Ocean; they thought they would land in the Atlantic Ocean.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, it tells about these men who go hunting for these hawks for the hawk but the hawks are really good because they eat all these harmful insects and stuff to the human beings.....And they have to pass a law to Pennsylvania before all these...before, you know, they get to these uh like they have specials, like a special day for hunting deer and things like that.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Like the...there's 85% uh that the the hawks they eat all the farmers, I mean all the human beings, in.. in.. insects and things that they don't need.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Poem

1. Tell me all you can about the poem you have just read.



Oh, it's about hmmm all the black smoke coming out of the factory chimneys? Ummm.....They just go to the sky and all the smoke goes just goes to the sky and...they're just made of black puff...black puff of smoke?

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

That there's too much pollution coming from the factories? And that it's...hmmm making things die. Hmmmmmm  
.....

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

#### CHILD FOUR

#### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, this is about two boys and a girl, I think, that were going...this this boy named--I think his name was Dan?--came over and their mother told them to take him around the city and show him and they wanted to go across the river to a foreign country so they were on the beach and they started getting into boats and Jo said that knew that they were goin' get in trouble and so they thought they would play pirates and so they got into a boat and they started paddling away in this little boat and pretty soon they came to this big ship, I guess,--boat--and they got they were going to climb onto it on the ladder and they told Jo to stay there

and watch the boat so it wouldn't drift away and so pretty soon Jo saw a man looking over the railing and so he told 'em and they jumped down into the boat again and they started row.. paddling, and the fog had come down so that and this man was trying to get them and so they just kept and pretty soon they couldn't hear--he had a squeaky oar--and pretty soon they couldn't hear it any more and so they just kept going but then they were silent and they just stood there and then and in the morning the fog lifted and so they could see, and then a storm was coming up because the sky was black and cloudy and so a Jo saw an island--he thought he saw an island--and it was and so they went over to it and they found this lighthouse so they went into it. They--it took all three of them to push the door closed--so they went in there and they they couldn't... all they saw was stairs winding up and so they at least it would keep them out of the wind and the cold so pretty soon uh Jo got Jo started crying because they he knew that nobody was coming because the light keeper was supposed to come but the light went on by itself and Jo found--I think it was a paint can with black--so a the light keeper saw that the light wasn't coming on like it was supposed to and then going off. It was just sort of staying off and then coming on like it was supposed to and then going off. It was just sort of staying off and then coming on a little bit and then going off. So he came to find out what it was so the he took 'em home over to the United States and said a, I think Dan said, "This doesn't

look any different from our country." And so I think that's all I can remember. (laugh)

2. What impressed you most in the story?

Ummm, I guess going out there and seeing finding the island, I guess.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Not that I can remember.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all that you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, ummm, men keep killing hawks and hawks well, they, oh dear, ...men think that they're very harmful, but they aren't. They say they eat things, you know, that that they're not supposed to but hawks are very useful to 'em. They eat insects, an mice, an rats, and all that junk that isn't good and helpful to man so hawks really help 'em. Let's see, in Michigan sportsmen help pass a law that a they can't they couldn't shoot hawks and that helped many other states. Before Pennsylvania was had that law uh thousands of birds were killed and a then, let's see...then this old-timer told 'em that after a day of shooting there were piles of hawks just lying there two or three feet deep and so now they're passing laws that a that you can't shoot hawks because they are helpful to man, they don't eat all this junk they're not supposed to. Let's see, I think that's about all.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

That they are stopping to kill hawks--saving 'em.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

I don't think so.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

This is about smoke coming out of factories and chimneys. They come out and they look like animals and they crowd around up in the sky and they push each other out of the way and they well, they just float around awhile and go out into the empty sky and...look like animals. (laugh)

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

Well, that smoke can be pretty, but it doesn't smell very good. (laugh)

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

I don't think so.

### CHILD FIVE

### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, it was dis a, about dis...uh...child. He and and....Dan and Ray are friends--something like dat. He went ...uh they went they tried to go across the river to go to a

foreign country and a dis child he wanted to go with them so he jus' went. Then dere was thick fo.. fo.. fog and this they went up dis cruiser and dis man saw saw 'em and chased them. The...uh...dey went then this man was chasing 'em they heard the oars squeak as when they stopped then when when they it wasn't squeaking anymore. Den when they got out of the fog there was a strong current that pulled them and a...a...den there was an island near but there was a storm coming...and a ...so they went to the island as fast as they could. Uh when they got there there was no one. There was jus' a light. They thought there was a light keeper but he went someplace else, and ships were a crossing the wa.. the ocean then they saw 'em, they tried to sign 'em but they couldn't. Then dey put put paint on the lighthouse--the beam of the light--and covered it with black paint so that on de other side it won't have light on it. That's how the keeper saw 'em and the keeper brought 'em back.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

Uh, I think Jo was a girl--Josephine.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No, I guess that's it.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Uh it's about these hawks and people are killing kill- ing 'em because they think a they kill chickens and everything

that people need, but peo.. uh scientists say that 85% that they eat are rats, mice, and insects that are harmful to man. And a in some states they give laws that you can't shoot a hawks, but in some uh some in some they jus' shoot 'em whenever they can in some in certain times. But uh...uh....this man, old-timer, he tries to protect 'em, you know, like the scientists say. But now dey're disappearing they get shot and die, but some are shot in wings and they jus' die of thirst and hunger...Uh....I guess that's all.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Uh people, some people are trying to help 'em.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

I don't think so.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

I tink it's a it's a story about pollution or something like that. They climb out of chimneys and they go up in the sky...and a they pollute the air, but she says it's just jokes....And then at the end it's jus' smoke and things like dat.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

Well, I don't really know, but...it jus' says uh about pollution. I don't know if she means it's no good or whatever.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Uh.....only that great black animals, I don't know what she means...Is it great black animals like to crawl. What does she mean by that? [Investigator: What do you think?]

I don't know, it's a puffs of smokes, black ones...or something like dat.....That's all.

#### CHILD SIX

#### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, these a.....two boys...I guess they were brothers. This boy named Ray came to visit them and they were lived in Canada. A...and this they got the uh.....well, they were uh thinking of something to do and and they went over by the river that separated Canada and the United States and a...a Can.. they looked looked over the river and they were goin' play like they were pirates and so they took they looked around and there was a cabin cruiser out in the middle or out a ways from the bank and so they got in an old rowboat that didn't have a oar, they used their hands and they got up and they were gonna act like they were pirates and they were gonna try to take over it and a fog came over and they said it was gonna be their smoke screen and so they went up and just as they were climbing onto the boat the boy named Dan uh..... he...uh...was climbin' onto the boat and a the boy that was

talking saw a man on the boat and he, Jo...Dan came down on the boat and they paddled, tried to paddle with their hands get away from the boat and the man got in another rowboat with an oar on the other side of the boat and came after them and and they finally got away but they were scared to move because of it and finally they but they were lost and and then so they just laid in the boat 'til dawn came and the fog cleared but there were still great big black clouds in the sky and so they paddled over to an island and when...they... Ray was about to run outa energy when they hit bottom and... they hit the beach of the island and then a it started to rain and and blow real bad and so they climbed up to a building, and a if the doors had been locked they would have been they would have never made it but they got up and got they climbed the stairs--there were just endless stairs--and got up at the top and it was a lighthouse and a....they they thought that pretty soon the the uh guy would the light keeper would come up and turn it on and find them but then when darkness came it turned on automatically so they thought that it they were gonna die because then nobody would ever come so they couldn't break it 'cause then some ship would get wrecked, but finally they took some paint that they found and painted the side that was on the United States side--painted that window black--and so pretty soon the light keeper came along to find out why. A...to find out why it didn't shine on the United States side and...so he he picked them up and took 'em over to the United States and they took a picture of 'em



and Ray was smiling, and Dilan was frowning--Dan was frowning, and.....Jo, I don't remember that part. He, I think, he was in the picture, but, and then it told at the last that his name was Josephine.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

I think the smartness of putting the paint on the one side because that way ships wouldn't be completely lost but somebody would still come ta see what was the matter and it wouldn't cause too much destruction.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

I don't know, I told it just about as best I could uh I remembered.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, uh these hunters were talking to the whoever wrote the story. It said uh...they that they wanted to kill all the hawks and everything because they were supposed to be bad, but now they're starting to pass laws in states like Michigan and Pennsylvania where it's against the law to shoot the birds because a they eat rats, and mice, and rodents like that that hurt the crops and stuff and one old-timer was talkin' to this guy and he said uh.....uh...he they that they used to have hawk hunting season and they used to go out and shoot birds and when they were finished in the day there'd be hawks dead or wounded bout three feet thick two or three

layers on the ground and the ones that were just wounded would go off in the bush, thick bush, and they just die of thirst and hunger and so now they're they're trying to conserve it like they're trying to conserve oil, coal, deer, and stuff like that.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Well, that uh people--us, the population,--is getting more and more than, there's gonna be less and less space so you should, we're going to have to try and conserve everything ...that...everything because pretty soon there isn't gonna be room if we don't watch out.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Uh, I don't think so.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Oh, it was just describing smoke, how it goes out of the factory chimney and up into the sky...into the clouds and empty sky...and uh it just...its tail's all curled and head held high. A...it's just a puff of smoke.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

It's, I think it's just talkin' about--just describing a puff of smoke coming out of a factory. I don't know if it has anything to do with pollution or not.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

APPENDIX C  
TRANSCRIPT OF STUDENT RESPONSES  
FROM SCHOOL B

## CHILD ONE

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, there was these three children and there was two boys and Jo, she's a girl, and she was they were in a rowboat and they wanted to cross the river to a foreign land. And they dropped their oars out in the water and so they paddled with their hands. And a storm came up and they uh were going...and they came up to a cruiser and they started to climb on the they didn't want to drift away and they saw this man was looking at them so they dropped the ladder and got back in the boat and then they paddled off as fast as they could and they heard this squeaky noise and it was...a...this rowboat that was tied to the other side of the cruiser and when they got they were up there and they had Jo back in the back paddling with her feet. She was kicking, and she finally got to where she could stand up on the sand in the water and they got up to shore and they climbed into a light house and when they got up then the next couple days later then this guy came for the lighthouse, he checks the lighthouse, and he got 'em and they were on the front page of the newspaper...and she finally told her name in the end.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

When they were up at the cruiser when that guy looked down at 'em it seemed sorta exciting and then when they took off...I liked that part. And they started paddling with their feet.....

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, this is a selection about hawks and it says that all hawks are bad and it tells about 85% of the food hawks eat...insects and rats and...mice...the other one (I don't know what it was) and this old-timer he said he's he's bout fifty years ago he said he used to pile ducks up bout three feet deep piles some...those were the ones that were dead and the ones that were just wounded to where they couldn't fly were all wandering up in the bushes to die of hunger and thirst.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

The hawks...what they eat...the insects and mice and things they eat.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

...No.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

This poem is about smoke that comes out of your chimney and makes clouds, and they call them big black animals. And

they say that they all crowd up and make lot of noise and they .....they're uh like big black clouds and then their their tails all curled up and their heads are held high.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

It's telling that you can see things that are just little things you can make big things out of.....when you look at 'em.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

I liked the poem real well.

#### CHILD TWO

#### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, there was these three boys that wanted to cross this river to get to a foreign country so they were kicking around docks and everything when they seen a great big bouy out in the water-far out...so they found a little rowboat and they were...uh...so they rowed out to the big boat and the fog set in before they got there and they bumped into the boat and they saw, and there was a ladder there and one of 'em started to climb up it and he got halfway up and the man came and looked over--he was on the deck--and the guy that was climbing up the ladder fell back into the boat and they pushed off and started to go away but soon they heard a squeaky oar coming and they paddled real fast to get away from it because they were scared and they were...finally they got

away from it and they just kept paddling trying to find land and they stopped paddling and they felt a current, and the current was pulling them in and so it was startin' to rain and everything so they got out and paddled to get into land and then their feet touched ground and they got there and they found a lighthouse and they went up there and they couldn't find any food or anything so they painted one window black and the man that was in--well he wasn't in the lighthouse, but he owned the lighthouse--came to see what was the matter and found those three and took 'em home.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

Hmmmmmm...it was right at the end how they got found  
.....how they were found.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, 85% of what prairie birds eat is insects, mice, and rats and people have been shooting them which they shouldn't be and conservation laws have been passed to stop them from shooting. One old-timer said that...uh...at the end of a day of hunting hawks there lay a pile three or two or three feet deep of hawks and some of the hawks which are wounded, hit in the wing, will lay there and die of thirst and so...uh...laws have been passed to keep people from shooting.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Uh the laws that have been passed to keep people from shooting--hawks.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No, thank you.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Well it's about pollution and it talks about the smoke coming out of big chimney pipes and that it's.....likes to crawl out with its head held up high and its tail curled up and we really don't need pollution.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

That pollution is dirty!

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No, thank you.

### CHILD THREE

### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Okay. There was...there was two kids...three kids... and they were in a foreign country and they wanted to go to an ...the American...country which was called the United States.



And they found this boat in their country and then they found this cabin across the shore some way and they got into the boat and they went...they paddled over to his uh cabin...and there was this man there and the kids saw this ladder and Ray, this one boy, started climbing up into the on the ladder and climbing up to the cabin and...uh...the other boy, I forget his name, he uh yelled to Ray that there was this man up at the top of the ladder and that uh he was startin' to push the ladder down and Ray heard him and he jumped down into the boat and the man pushed the ladder just as he reached the boat. And then the kids started going off towards the...off away from the uh cabin and the kids kept paddling and this guy got--there must have been a boat by the cabin because they heard uh these paddlings of squeaky oars. And they kept paddling and then finally they quit because they heard the oars coming closer--the squeaky oars--and they they just stayed still and then they...the oars kept coming closer and closer and then they felt that they were moving, they thought that they were moving, and so they kept they kept going with the uh boat and then they saw this island and Ray told the other boy to go and out to the back of the boat and start kicking while he paddled and so they went over to this uh island, they finally got over to the island and then they uh saw this lighthouse and they went to the lighthouse and they uh...they...went into it and then they saw some--well, it was locked--and then they saw some stairs and so they went up the stairs, they were real long, and they went up the stairs and they came to this

lighthouse where the light was that came on and off. And then they looked around for food and that and they went thought they didn't find any food but they thought that maybe somebody would come to turn on the lighthouse light so that the ships wouldn't get wrecked and...so they waited and waited and finally the light came on all by itself, and they had found some paint in this storeroom and they painted one window uh black, because they found some black paint, and they painted the window black, and then the manager--the guy that owned the lighthouse--couldn't figure out how come the light kept flickering off and on and so he went up to the lighthouse and he noticed he saw the kids and he saw the paint on there and so he started laughing and then the kids told him what had happened. And...that was all.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

When the guy uh the guy up at the cabin tried to tip the ladder over when Ray was on it.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Okay, there's it's about this bird that they called the bird of prayer and is why they called him that is because people would keep killing this bird and he there was about 85% of 'em that they had killed...about that...many...and so they

started calling this bird the bird of prayer and the bird would eat rats, mice, chickens, and other sorts of animals. And...he uh.....and he would there was people that would go out hunting for the bird and there was this old-timer and he shot, he would shoot these...sometimes shoot these birds and then at the end of the night he would come home and the birds when they had shot 'em they would go and land in a tree or something and then they would die of thirst or of hunger.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Well, that they should not shoot the bird of prayer.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Well, that there's this uh chimney and smoke was coming out and there was this bird like bird that they said was walking in air. And, really it was only uh smoke and the bird was actually flying in the air, instead of walking in a cloud.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

Well that sometimes you can just let your imagination go away...from you?

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

#### CHILD FOUR

##### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, there was these three boys one that was a Ray, and the other one was Dan and the other one was named uh Jo or Joseph and they went out and they were goin' and they found this old rowboat and one of them lived across the river from a foreign country and they wanted to get across the sea to the United States and so they found this uh this old rowboat and they started go across there and they saw this well, they saw the cabin cruiser out there and they found this old rowboat and they went out there and they started to climb up and this man came over and he just looked so they jumped back in the boat and they started rowing away and they didn't have any paddles so they were using their hand and they heard a squeaky oar and the guy was following them so uh they paddled faster and pretty soon they could see land ahead and...and uh .....and so uh uh so one of 'em got out in front and the other got in back and they kicked and one and they kicked with their legs and the other one and Jo stayed in the boat and they told him to keep on goin' and pretty soon, uh I think it was Dan who was in the back he fell down and he came up and there was he was standing on land and then they made their way to a

lighthouse and they found some paint and stuff but there wasn't any food and they saw some ships go by and they were goin' and if they signaled them they probably wouldn't a stop-ped anyways so finally the light turned on by itself, and uh it just glared in their face--it almost blinded 'em it said--and finally the light keeper came and then they went home and then they entered his then Dan who lived in the foreign country--I think it was--was discouraged to see that the United States just looked like the other country. That's all.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

Hmmmmmm, well, the way they went out to get that the way they went out to get the uh.....to get that cabin cruiser cause I wouldn't a done it. (laugh)

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Can't think of anything.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, it's about birds and hawks and some states are trying to save 'em because people are always are always shootin' 'em and and they might become extinct and then in one state they passed a law that they can't shoot hawks anymore, uh and hawks eat uh mice, rodents, and rats and all those kind of animals and that are uh harmless to well, and they eat men's crops and they ruin their crops and stuff and it tells about this old man who had three piles of birds about three feet deep

that he just killed.....and uh and...uh.....they're to save 'em and the sportsmen and--I forgot what state it was--are tryin' to uh they stopped it and they won't let 'em uh they won't let 'em shoot hawks anymore. Well, that was a short one.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Tryin' to save the hawks.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Oh, can't think of anything else.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Well, they were talkin' about animals from big long smoke stacks that curl and they were all different kinds of animals and they were all black and then at the end it says it was just a joke--that they're made out of smoke.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

Well, the way things smokes can make when it the way uh things smoke can make when it comes out of chimneys--it looks like animals and stuff.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

I can't think of anything.

## CHILD FIVE

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, first they were telling about the newspaper that had their picture in it and then they told about what happened. Well, first they showed their cousin, Dan, around the city. He wanted to see the river so they went down to the river and they walked around the shore for awhile and then they came to this dock and they saw a big...cruiser out in the big....so they they wanted to get out there, you know, and get on it and so they took this old rowboat and started rowing out there, you know, with their hands and they got there and they started getting up on the boat and they saw a man so they came they went back in and tried...they came back in the boat well, row-boat, and they paddled away as fast as they could through the fog, you know, it was a real thick fog and...and the man it sounded like he was coming after them, they heard a squeaky oar coming after them so they went by there, you know, and then they stopped and they couldn't hear anything and they couldn't see anything so they stopped awhile and they thought the boat was moving so one of them put their hand down you know and they were moving with the current and one of them said to wait until morning, you know, so they could see. Uh, but you see they said that in the morning they would be out to the Atlantic Ocean so they started paddling again...and .....and then the storm started to come up and storm started to and the fog cleared away and they started going

toward this island and one of them got out of the boat and started paddling, you know, to get to the island faster ahead of the storm and the wind started blowing and the waves started waving (laugh) and they finally got to the island and then they finally got to the island and then they stood up and they brought in the boat and they got out and they went to a village--a lighthouse--and they got in and tried to close the door and finally they did.....and.....and they got in and found winding stairs that went up and they found out it was a lighthouse so they went up and they found a lantern there and there wasn't any light keeper there so they said they'd wait until the light keeper came and then the girl she went to look for food, but all she found was some paint and things in a circle of it so she went back up and all of a sudden the light went on, you know, and she said, "Boy, now you did, you know, it 'cause the light keeper won't come because the light was on," and so they painted some of the windows black and the light keeper came and he went up to see why the light wouldn't go on on one side and he went up there and they found them and they went across it and they were in the United States and one of them was really disappointed because it didn't look any different and they got their picture taken in the paper .....and they and then she told that one of them was smiling and one was scowling and she was in the picture.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

The idea about painting one window black.



3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, it says that hawks, you know, anybody who hears the names hawks, you know, thinks of going and shooting them and now that some of 'em are almost extinct and that everyone thinks hawks--oohh you got to go shoot 'em, you know, and some states have passed laws that protect birds as it says in here and and some states, you know, have preserves for other animals and now they have for hawks and things--birds of prey--and one person in there says that they used to shoot 'em until there were piles of them two or three feet deep and that some of them get shoot that are just in the wings or in the leg and, you know, that they don't die right away and they die of thirst or something...like that.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Protecting the birds by law--passing the laws.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

It's about puffs of smoke. I mean, you know, out of the chimneys and they go like clouds and like birds--I'm not very good at reading poetry.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

Oh, it was saying that it just doesn't seem like puffs of smoke--it seems like something else. I mean it doesn't really look like a puff of smoke, it looks just like anything you can imagine.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

## CHILD SIX

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, it was about three...it was about three kids uh who lived in Canada and uh two kids uh one was Ray and the other they called Jo was a supposed to take their cousin, Dan, for a walk in the city and they went to the river that a separated Canada from the United States and a Dan wanted to play pirates when they saw a ship and they went...got into this old rowboat and went out to this ship and fog came out and then a man saw 'em and chased after them and a then...a storm came up and they went to the shore where a lighthouse

was and they thought they were gonna be stranded there for the rest of their lives and a they found out.....then they found out how to turn on the light and they did that and painted the black a the window facing the United States black and a the light watchman came to see if the...why it was going out all the time and a they found the three kids.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

A girl was telling it.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

It's about a bird of prey that we have to save like hawks and eagles and stuff. It says that 85% of their a diet is mice, and rats, and other things that are harmful and that we have to save them. It's true that sometimes they eat chickens and stuff, but they are helpful to man.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

That we need our birds of prey.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

(Shook head, no.)

Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

It's on smoke and a tells about what it can look like-- animals and stuff like that.....I don't know.....it's.....

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

It's a.....that they can make...smoke can make things look funny. (laugh)

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

APPENDIX D  
TRANSCRIPT OF STUDENT RESPONSES  
FROM SCHOOL C

## CHILD ONE

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Okay, uh let's see.....one day Dan and.....was it Tom? Dan and Ray...and.....well, and and his sister they were goin' down to, Dan wanted to go to the....a to the shore and they .....went.....wait a minute, he said that a he saw too many houses and stores and so he wanted to go to the shore where the...a.....where the uh.....where the United States on the other side and he uh and he and Ray and his sister went down there and they got into this boat and they were uh rowing they put Dan and Ray pushed the boat off and they were goin' along and then they uh then there were dark, dark clouds in the in the sky and and then it was getting darker and it started started a storm wave and....and they they saw this boat and they were gonna get up on it where this ladder was and then this man came and they--I guess he saw 'em--and then he started chasing goin' after goin' after them and they could hear him goin' with a squeaky noise and they were tryin' to go so fast and fast to get away from the man that was following 'em and then they saw this other boat, let's see, and then the boat stopped following and then they and then a Ray Ray stuck his hand in the water and he said that he was in a tide they were in a tide Ray said and uh they were goin' down goin' down real fast 'cause it--the boat-- was pushing by itself so many and then that's.....and .....oh, yeah, and they came to this land and they a they

got on the sand and the girl said how the sanded tasted so good and then they saw this light, I mean I guess they saw this door and they opened it up and they went in and they couldn't get it almost shut and then they shut it and then they went all the way upstairs to the very top and they were and they saw this light and they looked out to see if anybody was there and they said the lighthouse keeper wasn't there and a then after that they.....a.....they they went downstairs down down at the bottom of the lighthouse and she she started to cry and she said that a...that if anybody had a come they all he would they would see was skeletons in the window looking out and then they went back up there and they .....let's see.....they were a Ray said to uh break the, no, Don said to break the uh light so it could uh see if if anybody would come and, but Dan, Ray said not to because it it might do a wreck to one of the ships.....and...then they were takin' it all and then the lighthouse man came and...uh .....and because the he saw that the lights weren't comin' on and after awhile the shore, you know, it started clearing up. And that's all I can think.....(sigh)

2. What impressed you most in the story?

Oh, when they when the boat started, you know, following them--the big boat--and the that man got in there and they started and the boat started following them.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Uh, let's see, ...uh they said that uh 85% of hawks eat rats and mice, let's see, .....and they're trying to pass laws to uh get rid of hawks and and to in some countries they're trying to pass laws to a save hawks 'cause they uh .....because they're helpful to man and a for killing mice and other such diseases and stuff like that and.....  
oh, yeah, and they said that uh....the uh birds that, I mean the hawks that uh....are wounded by the wing die instantly unless they are a helped by someone and they said that uh two or three feet of hawks are piled up in in deep, now let me see, on the ground on the ground, let's see, and some of 'em are jus'...not they're not dead yet and that's all I can think.....(long, deep sigh)

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

About their passin' the laws to save 'em.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Oh, it said that it was a factory chimney...and great black animals great black animals like to crawl...let's see



.....they push each over each other and shove and crowd...  
 let's see.....they nose the wind and.....crawling a  
 cloud...let's see.....let's see.....for they are just a  
 puff of smoke? That's all I can think.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

Hmmmm, let's see, about factories and chimneys with  
 the uh with the black smoke coming out of the the uh factory's  
 thing.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have  
 told me?

No.

## CHILD TWO

### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, this...uh.....well this started they wanted to  
 go a to a different country.....uh...and there was a boy  
 named Dan and a boy named Ray and a and another boy named  
 Josephine. They they were going out and they saw they went  
 out and they saw a boat--no, Dan saw a boat and...he... said,  
 "Come on, let's go," and he wanted they were going to be  
 pirates. Then they started rowing out to the sea and then  
 they got into this big, thick fog and they heard a squeaky oar  
 from the boat and they thought that some somebody was chasing  
 them and they kept on pedaling, uh rowing real fast and then  
 they didn't hear the squeaky sound and then they the boat  
 started to move by itself and Don shouted out they were on a

current.....then.....and then they got into the land and they got out and then it started and then they started to row and the they started to row and then they they then they saw this island and they started to row real fast and then they got out and then they they went in this this little cabin, I think, and and they they they knew a man would come to turn on the light--there was a lamp there--then one of the one of the one of the boys said, "Let's let's let's break the lamp," and then the other one said "No, a ship might wreck." And then then one of them said but then they seen the light switch on by itself and then Josephine, I think, he--is that a boy or a girl? [Investigator shrugged] Well, I think I think Josephine she said she said by the time somebody comes there will be three skeletons looking out the window and I think that's all I can remember.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

I think that part when the the man was chasing the kids in the rowboat.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, the it's a story about birds and hawks and well, they say any hawk is bad, any hawk is a bad hawk.....uh hunters say that their guns uh blast deadly fires and that's uh

.....and for years scientists saying the.....  
 and this permissiveness of prairie that they are 85%.....  
 good, I think, because umm, they're good because they a they  
 a kill mice, rats, some even eat chickens and then there's  
 this old man he's goin' tell the story.....(sigh) and  
 that and that they and that he see that there's a pile three  
 feet deep, I think, and the man he likes birds.....and they  
 they some are unable some are unable to fly and they disap-  
 pear into great deep brushes and and.....I can't  
 think of anything else.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in  
 this selection?

Well,.....I think to keep the hawks, they're  
 good they're good animals and then.....

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have  
 told me?

Well, just that there's this book on it.....

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just  
 read?

It's about out of the factories uh...great black  
 animals crawl to the chimney.....umm.....and  
 they have their tails all curled and their head held high  
 .....and then that they're not real because they're just  
 made of old puff smoke.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

Hmmmm, about pollution, I guess, and lettin' out smoke--puffs of smoke and.....

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### CHILD THREE

#### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

First off I think they said that.....I have to think about it...sometimes it's kinda hard for me to remember... things.....(sigh) well, uh.....tryin' to remember where I.....I can remember the name, one of the names was Jo.....the kids--one of them was Jo and the other two I can't remember...and then they...there were.....well .....first off they were takin' a walk along the river and they seen this here cabin cruiser and this one of the kids said said that they might be pirates and take over the boat so they found a little rowboat and started rowing out there, they were paddling with their hands because they could not there wasn't any oars and then the fog some fog came in and they got out started to climb the ladder and there was a man in it and then they all got down in the boat and started paddling away from it and a they heard oars behind them and they thought the man was chasing them and then they didn't hear it no more and then they thought the man might have gaven up--gave up--so then they kept on paddlin' and then the storm came up so then they found this

little island and paddled to that then a when they were on the island one of the kids fell flat on his face in the sand and said and it said then he said how good the sand tasted and then they said that they found a building which was a lighthouse so they went up into that and then they were up in the top and they were tellin' 'em to break this window thing up on top where the light was and then they one this one kid by the name of Jo he said that if they did then a ship might get wrecked so then he went--this kid by the name of Jo--he went lookin' for some food and he found some black paint from the storeroom so...then the light keeper couldn't figure out why the light quit goin' off when it was on the American side of the lighthouse and he laughed when he came in there and found out that the this kid they had that it was painted with black paint 'cause with the kid that with the paint that the kid found in the storeroom. So then I think it said that they got home.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

The part where they said that they were going to be pirates and capture the cabin cruiser.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, uh it talked about hawks and it said that some people shoot told about hawks getting shot down and 85% of them, ah, I forget what it said after that, and then it said that when they were shot down after the shooting stopped and there was piles three to four--four to five--feet deep.....of dead hawks laying on the ground then it said that some hawks die will die instantly if they're shot in the wing unless they're helped and that science says, wait, and then says that they eat mainly insects, mice, and rats and sometimes they'll eat kill chickens and eat them but to remember that mainly they just eat mice, rats, and insects.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

It said somethin' about savin' hawks, too, so I think that would be the most important thing.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No. Uh some of those things I like just the way they are.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

It said the out of the chimneys tall.....big black animals crawl.....and some other things which I can't remember.....too good.....

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

.....Well, it's talking about smoke, I know that.  
 And it's--what it means is that--I don't actually know what  
 it means, but I know what it's talking about, though, smoke  
 and all that.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have  
 told me?

No.

#### CHILD FOUR

#### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

.....Starting from the uh first? They were  
 pretendin' that they were they were goin' be pirates.....  
 and they wanted to go on a cruiser.....got stuck in  
 the storm and came to shore and they found a lighthouse which  
 they went in and the light turned on and they painted the  
 window black and the lighthouse keeper came and they were  
 rescued.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

When they were in the storm.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have  
 told me?

No.

#### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have  
 just read.

Before men used ta kill the hawks which were useful to them.....useful to them and the ways that hawks eat the animals that were harmful to man.....That's all I can think of.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

They shouldn't kill the hawks.....The...the animals that the hawks eat are, hmmmmmmm, too.....(big sigh)

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

That the animals are just a joke that came out of the factories' chimneys because they're only made out of puffs of smoke.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

.....I don't know.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.



## CHILD FIVE

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, there was these two boys and they went over they got in this boat and they went over to see they went they got in this boat to see they went over to see ta see this foreign country because they've never seen a foreign country before. And...they...got...and they met...they were in this...house--boat--and they found a lamp and this guy knew how to work it.....and.....and then he threw somethin' and broke it and then...then...so that somebody--that's the only way he could get help--and...then... finally they got to the foreign country. And that's all I know.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

About the two boys that when they got to go over to see the foreign country.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well,.....you have, there is a certain time when you can only hunt and a and 85% of the birds eat mice, rats, and other things.....and.....and that's about all.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Is that the...85% of the birds eat mice and rats..... and other things.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Out of the.....chimley tall.....black animals like to crawl.....but their terrible, I don't know that word,.....fearances is just a joke .....for they only make a puff of smoke. That's all.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

.....That out of the factory the chimley is tall..... for they only make a puff of smoke.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### CHILD SIX

### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, uh what I think about it or?

[Investigator: Just all the things you can tell me about it.]

It, about whether it was exciting or not or what?

[Investigator: What happened?]

Oh, they they, these boys and one girl was uh traveling and they and they lived in the city and they came to the country where this a lake kinda a sorta was and they wanted to play pirates and they were gonna capture the the girl so they started uh...and they they got in a boat an they they went over to the girl an an captured her an an tied her...up and then the the boys they they they took the they untied her and and took and threw the ladder into the boat and they and they thought an it was...they went sail and they accidentally went out to the uh place and they thought they were gonna go into the Atlantic Ocean instead they they they came nearby a a island by dawn and they paddled their feet over to the... the...island and they found this lighthouse where where there was two, they found they sorta explored it and they found some paint and tools in the in the storeroom and then the.....  
.....that's all I know.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

I liked the ending where they found the island...and they went on the island.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Not really, except that it was a good story. I liked it.

Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Uh it was a scientific a...a...speech or whatever it is--story about a birds an an mostly about hawks and what they they eat: mice, 85% of mice, and rats, and harmful insects to men, and that that they should only have certain times of the year to shoot 'em and that.....that the game to conservation is more important than...what... what...the...the...food is...to us.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Uh that hawks are a helpful bird.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

I think that hawks hawks are a good bird that they that they shouldn't be shot down anytime of the year.

Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Oh, it's about a...well uh I think its about air pollution and what it does it it's a big--just nothin' that we want. It just clouds up the air so we can't breathe. And I think whoever wrote it wrote a good poem.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

That that we should get rid of air pollution--that we don't need it.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

APPENDIX E  
TRANSCRIPT OF STUDENT RESPONSES  
FROM SCHOOL D

## CHILD ONE

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Okay. Well, the story was interesting in that it sorta seemed scarey 'cause I thought they were going to land out in the Atlantic Ocean and end up in New York Harbor. Seemed sorta cool 'cause if, you know, they didn't know what they--she didn't know what they were going do 'cause...they were all whispering and she didn't want to seem rude.....

2. What impressed you most in the story?

The fact she was a girl; I thought it was a boy.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

.....Not much.

Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, it is it was interesting 'cause I didn't know so much about the birds of prey and I didn't know...that they that 85% of their food was the rodents instead of the chickens. I thought maybe 75% less was. I knew they ate a lot of 'em. I didn't know also that eagles ate that stuff 'cause I thought that they ate the fish more.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

The fact that they oughta be protected.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Yeh, I think they oughta be protected in all fifty states...and territories.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

It's a good one and it tells just how the smoke looks like coming out of a chimney. That...well, it looks like... it just sorta makes you think of smoke. And that that factory smoke, you know,...There's a chimney oh, over by Everett that I've seen and it and it looks just like this describes.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

It's saying that, well, maybe the smoke it just looks ...they look ferocious but they really aren't that ferocious, you know, the they they come out and they push each other and they go "froooooom" and they create big black clouds, but they melt sometimes.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### CHILD TWO

### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, uh first of all there are uh I think two boys and they were playing pirates at this--around a river--and



finally they got into a rowboat and it got away from the docks and uh they started flowing down a river...and they kept going and going and they couldn't see where they were because the fog was so heavy and so finally a after a long time they came to this island...and they after a struggle they got to the island and they came to a lighthouse and they went up to the lighthouse and they looked for food but they couldn't get any and they thought that the keeper would come and find them, but one night the light flashed on by itself so they know it was hopeless, but then finally after awhile the keeper came and they found 'em and they got their pictures in the paper and everything.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

Well, uh...I think probably when they're they saw that island...and they're trying to get to it and they came up to the lighthouse and everything.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No, I don't think so.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Okay, Well, this is about birds of prey and the hawk. In Michigan they are trying to conserve it, and a 85% of its food is mice, rats, and other insects. Uh, let's see, and so one old-timer said that fifty years ago hawks a lay in piles of two or three feet deep--dead--and uh...not just by being shot

but sometimes by hunger. Uh...other...other things uh they do eat chickens, but they still eat mostly mice, rats, and other insects, and other insects and other animals that are harmful to man.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

To conserve the birds.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Yeh, I don't really think they're they say they're doing all this stuff, but I don't think they really are doing it that much. They gotta enforce their laws more.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Well, I think it's about all the black smoke out of the chimney and it's like a bird, dirty birds clawing and everything, and it's about...I think it's about pollution and how it's wrecking our land...and everything.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

Well, just what I said, I think it's all dirty and coming out of the chimney and everybody--we should try to help stop pollution.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

## CHILD THREE

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, Dan and Jo and Ray...they were fooling around on the other--in Canada--and...they...they wanted to get across the river to get on this cruiser, they wanted to see what it was, and so they got on a boat and they went to this cruiser but this man was leaning over and he saw 'em and so they went they went away from the cruiser, and the man kept following them so they came to this island and...they .....they came to this island and they were exhausted and cold and tired and then they they were in the lighthouse and...they sa.. they painted the window of the lighthouse black and they smashed, they a...they tried to get the attention of the light keeper, and when the light keeper came they found out they were in America and they said it didn't look any different from Canada.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

When the man kept following them from the cruiser.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Okay. Well, it's mostly about hawks and how before our conservation laws were passed in Pennsylvania the hawks were killed by thousands and...a mostly the farmers...that they only ate chickens and the...and but 85% of their diet is mice, and rats, and insects. (Sigh).....And.....That's all I can say.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Well, it's about factories and their smoke that pollutes and how industries think that all this--their waste and stuff--really doesn't do anything, but it really does.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

That it--factories really do pollute, and the smoke does, too.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### CHILD FOUR

### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

It, well, uh...it's about two boys--three boys--Dan, Josephine, and.....Ray. And they were uh try...they lived

across the river from the United States and they were trying to cross the river to get to the United States and they were going to uh go by a rowboat and ride over to a cabin cruiser and then get on that and go to the United States on that. But as they were a climbing on it they were about to climb onto the cabin cruiser a man saw 'em so they couldn't and they got into their rowboat and started rowing, but there wasn't any paddle so they had to use their hands. And then as they were rowing they came a storm started--there was fog--and then by dawn the fog went away and the storm was starting to come up, but they saw a island ahead of 'em so they kept paddling with their hands and then Ray got in the back of the uh boat and Dan got in the front and they started kicking with their feet towards the island so they could get there before the storm, and they uh did, and they started to run because they saw this cabin and they ran--they thought it was a cabin because it looked like a building--but they ran into it and all there was was winding stairs, but it was a light-house so they walked up all the winding uh stairs to the top of it and there wasn't a keeper there...so they thought that they would never uh be saved but then Dan, I mean Josephine, thought that by putting black paint over the window so that when the light went towards the American side the...that that no that it would get attention and that no one that someone would come and it did and the light keeper came and they took 'em to the United States and when they got there Ray said that it wasn't any different from theirs--from their country.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

That their country wasn't much different from ours.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, it's about hawks and why men are always shooting them and that men think that hawks are harmful to their animals, but some hawks eat eat chickens, but 85% of their their food isn't is mice and other harmful animals and insects that hurt the farmers' crops and things and that if they keep keep on going the same way they are that in uh little, in a few years maybe, the farmers might kill all the hawks. And that that in uh Michigan they've got a law that you can't shoot any hawks and some of the other people in other states like that law so they don't shoot any hawks.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Well, that by the way people still going they're doing this with other animals and if they keep up the way of killing animals for just the sport or for clothing or things that they're gonna uh kill the they're gonna kill all the wild life and that we need that to keep the uh food cycle going.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Well, that...uh...the hawks are also being uh killed because that--well, no, the bald eagles are being killed because they look like their babies look like hawks--and by shooting the farmers think that they are hawks and they shoot 'em but they're really the bald eagle babies and that is why the bald eagles are going extinct.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Well that it's about smoke stacks and that their as their smoke comes out it makes forms that with your imagination you can think they're animals or things that you've seen before or people and then you can just keep watching 'em and you can think that they're doing things, but they're really not.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

.....Well, that smoke stacks are als.. they're uh people enjoy seeing the things they make but they're also harmful...Or uh like they're smog and there's there smoke and pollute also, so some people think that they're terrible, but they also like it for their smoke because they make things that they like, also.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

## CHILD FIVE

Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, it was about uh these three boys that took their cousin to see the river and they uh went to see a cruiser and they bumped into the cruiser when they were climbing up the ladder they saw someone so they went away and they thought uh the guy from the cruiser was following them. And then it was all foggy and they couldn't see and then a storm came and they to an island and went into the lighthouse and were waiting for someone to come, but no one came, and finally they thought of something. They uh painted one of the windows black with paint and so the light keeper came because he saw their--one of the sides wasn't working and the other one was.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

Well,...(laugh) a...a...when the a...when the they thought of painting the window black and so that uh when the light keeper came when it wasn't shining on the one side.

3. would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

Uh, no, I can't thing of anything.

Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, it was about uh when they used to shoot hawks or hawks, yeh, a long time ago, and then lots of state have



changed it so that they can't shoot hawks, but some people are still uh killing them and their main thing is that a... their main meal is uh rats and things like...and mice and things like that uh that are harmful to men.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

Umm, Ummm, the idea of conser.. conserving wild life.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No, I don't think so.

### Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Well, it's about uh smoke coming out of chimneys of buildings and making air pollution and all that.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

That uh they shouldn't have the smoke such smoke and everything coming out of chimneys. It should be more steam or something that doesn't pollute the air as much.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

### CHILD SIX

### Fiction

1. Tell me all you can about the story.

Well, uh these children wanted to get across uh wanted to swim boy wanted to get across the river to a foreign country to see ummm...what it's like, and so...he was a pre-tending to be a pirate and he took this boat--this little row-boat--but there was no paddles so they paddled with their hands. Then it was foggy, and so they paddled out to this cabin cruiser and bumped into it. Well, it wasn't a cabin cruiser it was just a cruiser. And so uh the man was watching them and so they jumped back in and paddled away and they heard this oar squeak and the storm. Then they then they uh thought that they must have had a....had...a a rowboat on the other side of the boat so they paddled real hard and then they stopped and they listened awhile and they didn't hear and so they kept on paddling and paddling until they discovered the current was takin' 'em, and so...they....discovered that there was going to be a storm and so they paddled real fast until they were tired and so one guy suggested that a boy would get on the other end of the boat and hold onto the boat and kick his feet on the water so he did that and they came to shore that way and then they went into a lighthouse and they painted it black so that could--they painted a window where the light was shining so that someone would see them.

2. What impressed you most in the story?

.....When the kids stole that boat.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

...No.

Nonfiction

1. Tell me all you can about the selection you have just read.

Well, uh they say...they say that...uh birds of prey are vanishing in many parts of the country. And 85% of the birds eat mice, rats, and insects and other harmful things to men. And...one man said that a...said when he was only... that birds were killed...then stacked in two feet to three feet of of 'em and a lot of 'em were wounded and they would all die of hunger and thirst. That's all, I think.

2. What do you think is the most important idea in this selection?

To save the birds.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.

Poem

1. What can you tell me about the poem you have just read?

Well, they're really not saying that it's polluting the air so it's sorta like like there's well, the poet said that they're...they crowd each other and that and that they scratch the clouds...and they make a lot...a lot of dust.

2. What do you think the poem is saying?

That smoke is polluting the air.

3. Would you like to add anything to what you have told me?

No.